PRESENTATION OF DEEDS

by

Abu Shahiryaar

ISLAMIC-BELIEF.NET

PRESENTATION OF DEEDS

BY

Abu Shahiryaar

بِسْمِ اللهِ الرَّحْمَٰنِ الرَّحِيمِ

الحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ نَسْتَعِينُهُ وَنَسْتَغَفِرُهُ وَنَعُودُ بِاللَّهِ مِنْ مُرُورٍ أَنْفُسِنَا مَنْ يَهْدِهِ اللَّهُ فَلاَ مُفِسلٌ لَهُ وَمَنْ يُضْلِلْ فَلاَ هَادِى لَهُ وَأَنْهَدُ أَنْ لاَ إِلّٰهَ الأَ اللّهُ وَأَفْرَدُ أَنَّ مُحْتَمًا عَنْدُهُ وَمُسْهِلُهُ

All the praise be to Allah, we seek his help and apologize to him and find refuge in him from the mischief of ourselves and whom Allah guided none can mislead him and whom he sent astray none can guide him and I witness that there is no God except Allah and that Muhammad is his slave and prophet.

Almighty Allah has informed us in his glorious book that all records goes back to Allah. Allah says in Quran:

وَإِنَى اَللَّهِ تُرجَعُ اَلأُمُورُ And to Allah return all matters (for decision). [Al- Baqara 2:210]

وَإِلَيْهِ يُرجَعُ آلاَّمْرُ كُلُهُ and to Him return all affairs (for decision). [Hud 11:123]

وَلِلَهِ عَاقِبَهُ الأُمُورِ And with Allah rests the end of (all) matters (of creatures). [Al-Hajj 22:41]

وَإِلَى النَّهِ عَاقِبَةُ الأُمُورِ And to Allah return all matters for decision. [Luqman 31:22]

أَلَآ إِلَى آللَهِ تَصِيرُ آلأُمُورُ Verily, all matters at the end go to Allah (for decision). [Ash-Shura 42:53]

This shows that according to Quran our deeds are presented to Allah and none else. However there are narrations which speak otherwise and it is important to investigate the authenticity of these narrations.

Roaming Angels

A false Narration attributed to Abdullah Ibn- Masood

The often quoted narration which is attributed to Abdullah ibn Masood may Allah be pleased with him which is reported in Nisai, chapter ناب الشَكَرَ عَلَى النَّمَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ عَلَى النَّمَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ

أَخْبَرَنَا عَبْدُ الْوَهَّابِ بَنْ عَبْدِ الْحَكَمُ الْوَرَاقُ قَالَ حَدَّتَنَا مَعَاذُ بَنْ مُعَادِ عَنْ مُعَادِ عَنْ مُعَادِ عَنْ مُعْفِانَ بِنِ سَمِيدٍ ح و أُخْبَرَنَا عَنْحُودُ بَنْ عَيْلِانَ قَالَ حَدَّتَنَا مُعَاذُ وَكِيعٌ وَعَبْدُ الرَّرَاقِ عَنْ مُعْفِدا اللَّهِ بَنِ السَّائِبِ عَنْ زَافَانَ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ فَيَا السَّائِبِ عَنْ زَافَانَ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ فَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِلَّهِ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللَّهِ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللَّهِ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللَّهِ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللَّهِ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَمٍ إِنَّ لِللَّهِ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللَّهِ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِلللهِ عَلَى عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللّهِ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللّهِ عَلَى عَلَى وَاللّهِ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللّهِ عَلَى عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللّهِ عَلَى عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمٍ إِنَّ لِللّهِ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَمٍ إِنَّ لِللّهِ عَلَى وَاللّهُ وَلَا عَلَى وَاللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلّمٍ إِنَّ لِللّهِ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلّمٍ إِنْ اللّهُ وَلَوْلِ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلّمٍ إِنْ اللّهُ وَلَوْلَ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلّمٍ إِنْ اللّهِ وَلَوْلَ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلّمٍ إِنْ اللّهُ وَلَا عَلَى عَلَيْهُ وَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ وَلَا عَلَيْهِ وَسَلّمٍ إِنْ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلّمٍ اللّهُ وَلَى عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ وَاللّهِ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَالْعَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَاللّهُ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَاللّهُ اللّهُ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ اللّهُ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَاللّهُ اللّهُ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَاللّهُ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَى عَلْمَ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَمُ عَلَى عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَعَلَى اللّهُ اللّهُ عَلْكُ عَلْمَ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ اللّهِ عَلَى عَلْمَ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ اللّهُ اللّهُ اللّهُ عَلَى عَلْمَا اللّهُ الللّهُ اللّهُ

Narrated in Musnad Al-Bazzar:

حدثنا يوسف بن موسى قال : نا عبد المجيد بن عبد العزيز بن أي رواد عن سفيان عن عبد الله بن السائب عن زاذان عن عبد الله عن النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم قال : (إن لله ملائكة سياحين يبلغوني عن أمتي السلام) قال : وقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم : (حياتي خير لكم تحدثون و محدث لكم ووفاتي خير لكم تحدثون و محدث الله عليه خير لكم تعرض علي أعمالكم فما رأيت من خير حمدت الله عليه وما رأيت من شراستغفرت الله لكم)

Zazzan reported that Abdullah ibn Masood reported that Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said My life is good for you that you report (ask) and I would tell you and my death is good for you, your deeds would be presented on me and I would praise Allah when I see good and I would ask Allah's forgiveness if I notice evil.

Both of these narrations are reported by **Zazzan**, who is unique in reporting this report. Among thousands of students of Abdullah ibn Masood he is the only narrator who reported it.

Illat (Issues) with Zazzan's narration

According to Ilm-ul-hadith (علم الحديث) – rules of checking the reliability of a hadith attributed to Prophet (blessings be upon him) and his companions, there are several *Illat* علت (issues) with this report: Illat I: Zazzan was not a student of ibn

Masood

Al-Dhahabi, in his book Mu'jam al-Shaykh al-Kabeer, under heading (Shaykh Ibrahim bin Ahmad bin Hatim al-Faqih al-Qudwa, Abu Ishaq al-Balbaqi, imam of the Mosque of Bata'in):

عَنْ سَفْيَانَ، مَدَّقَنِي عَبْدُ اللهِ بْنُ السَّائِب، عَنْ زَاذَانَ، عَنْ عَبْدِ اللهِ بْنَ السَّائِب، عَنْ زَاذَانَ، عَنْ عَبْدِ اللهِ ، غَنِ الأَرْضِ اللهِ ، غَنِ اللَّهِ غِي الأَرْضِ مَلائِكَةَ سَيَّاحِينَ يَبْلِغُونَنِي عَنْ أُمُّتِي السَّلامَ أَخْرَجُهُ النَّمَائِيُّ مِنْ عِبْدِ ، مَنْ سُفْيَانَ النَّوْرِيِّ، رَوَاهُ أَبُو إِسْحَاقَ الفَرَارِيُّ، عَنِ النَّوْرِيِّ، عَنْ النَّوْرِيِّ، عَنْ رَادَانَ، عَنِ ابْنِ مَسْمُودٍ، وَلَا لَمُنْ مِنْ ابْنِ مَسْمُودٍ، وَلَا لَذَى مَنْ عَبْدِ اللهِ بْنِ السَّائِب، عَنْ زَاذَانَ، عَنِ ابْنِ مَسْمُودٍ، وَلَا لَذَى مُنْ عَبْدِ اللهِ بْنِ السَّائِب، عَنْ زَاذَانَ، عَنِ ابْنِ مَسْمُودٍ، وَلَا لَذَى مُنْ عَبْدِ اللهِ مُنْ السَّائِب، عَنْ زَاذَانَ، عَنِ ابْنِ مَسْمُودٍ، وَلَا لَنْ لَنْ مَنْ عَبْدِ اللهِ اللهِ السَّائِب، عَنْ زَاذَانَ، عَنِ ابْنِ مَسْمُودٍ، وَلَا لَهُ لَا لِهُ لِللّهِ اللّهِ اللهِ اللهُ اللهِ ا

Al-Nasaa'i has reported it in different ways, (narrated Abu Ishaq al-Fazari, Al-'Amash, 'Abd Allah b. al-Sa'ib, 'Zadhaan, Ibn Mas'ud), and he (Zazzan) did not meet him (Ibn Masood).

Al-Dhahabi also mentioned this in discussion on another narration of Zazzan from Ibn Masood in his Book of Taqis kitab al-Maoduaat by ibn al-Jawzi:

حَدِيث: آ ذَهَابِ الْبَصَر مَفْعَرَة للذنوب وَذَهَابِ السّمع مَفْعَرَة للذنوب وَمَا نقص من الجُسَد فعلى قدر ذَلِك آ فِيهِ دَاوُد بن الزِيْرِقَان واه عَن مطر الوراق عَن هارُون بن عتَرَة عَن عبد الله بن السَّائِب عَن زَاذَان عَن البن مَسْمُود وَلِم يُدْركهُ.

Al-Dhahabi mentioned under discussion on narration that Zadhan did not meet Ibn Masood.

Zadhan repented at the hands of Ibn Mas'ud, is nothing short of fiction. According to The Book of Tanbeeh al-Ghafilin by Sa'id al-Anbiyyah wa'l-Marsalin by Abu'l-Layth Nasr b. Muhammad b. Ahmad b. Ibrahim al-Samarkand:

وَرُوِيَ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ مَشْهُو رَضِيَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى عَنْهُ، أَنَّهُ مَرَّ ذَاتَ يَوْمٍ فِي مَوْضِعٍ مِنْ نَواجِي الْكُوفَةِ، فَإِذَا الْفُشَاقُ قَدِ الجَنْمَمُوا وَهُمْ يَشْرُبُونَ الْخَنْرَ وَفِيهِمْ مُعَنَّ يُقَالُ لَهُ زَاذَانُ It is narrated that one day Ibn Masood (may Allaah be pleased with him) passed through the outskirts of Kufa, where many drunkards used to gather and drank alcohol. (According to story) Zazzan was among those drunkards, but upon the reprimands of Ibn Masood, Zazzan repented for committing such acts and became one of Ibn Masood's followers.

Abu Muhammad Ja'far bin Muhammad bin Nasser bin Qasim al-Baghdadi, also known as Al-Khaldi(d. 348 AH), narrated that this incident in his work Kitab-ul-Labaaf wa'l-Zahad wa'l-Raqaiq wa'l-Mar'athi with chain:

حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ الفُقَالُ الفَارِحِيُّ بِالفَارِسِيَّةِ، عَنْ رَجُلٍ، عَنْ أَبِي هَامِم، عَنْ زَاذَانَ،

This chain has an unknown narrator and according to rules of Ilm-ul-ahadith, this is not a trustworthy report.

عن Illat II: Sufyan narrating with According to rules of hadith narration, a narrator must clarify from whom has taken the report. If he say explicitly (حَدثنَا أُو حَدثني) then it means he must have heard the report. If he speaks vaguely about whether 'he' or 'she' narrated the information and does not specify whether the report was directly conveyed to him or if it was specifically recounted in his presence, then such a report is not reliable when the narrator become famous for hiding the real name of the narrator. This phenomenon is known as Dalus (hiding) and the narrator is called *Mudlis* (one who hides). Sufyan is a well known Mudlis and care must be taken is accepting his reports for matters related to faith.

Sufyan al-Thori is considered as a Mudalis (مدلی) narrator and his reports with are not reliable in matters of faith. In book Tahzeeb al-Kamal: According to Imam Ahmed: Sufyan has heared only three narrations from 'Abd Allah b. al-Sa'ib al-Kindi, al-Shaybani, al-Kufi.

وقال: أحمد بن حنبل: سمع منه الثوري ثلاثة أحاديث.



سَمِعت أبي يَقُول قَالَ يحيى بن سعيد مَا كتبت عَن سُفْيَان
شَيْنًا إِلَّا مَا قَالَ حَدثِي أَو حَدثَنَا إِلَّا حَديثِين ثُمَّ قَالَ أبي حَدثَنَا
يحيى بن سعيد عَن سُفْيَان عَن سماك عَن عِكْرِمَة ومعية عَن
إِيْرَاهِيم فَإِنْ كَانَ مِنْ قَوْم عَدُوّ لَكُمْ وَهُوَ مُؤْمِنٌ قَالًا هُوَ الرجل
يسلم في دَار الحُرْب فَيقُتل فَلَيْسَ فِيهِ دِيّة فِيهِ كَفَّارَة قَالَ أبي
يسلم في ذار الحُرْب فَيقْتل فَلَيْسَ فِيهِ دِيّة فِيهِ كَفَّارَة قَالَ أبي
هذَيْن الحَدِيثِين الَّذِي زعم يحيى أنه لم يسمع سُفْيَان يَقُول فيهمَا
حَدثنا أو حَدثنى

... My father said: Imam Yahya claimed that Sufyan did not hear some ahadith, and Sufyan still said in chain *Hadathni* (he informed me/us specially) (موثناً أو خدائي)

Illat III: Zazzan is a Shiitte

Imam Dolabi has informed us in his work titled Al-Kuna-wal-Asma (juz 4- pg 404) that the Zazzan was among the Shiites.

أخبرني محمد بن إبراهيم بن هائم ، عن أبيه ، عن محمد بن عمر قال : زاذان أبو عمر الفارسي مولى لكندة ، أدرك عمر ، وكان من شيعة علي ، هلك في سلطان عبد اللك

Muhammad bin Umer (Al-Waqidi) said that Zazzan Abu Umer Al-Farisi Maula Kindah found (the era of) Umer and was among the people of Abdullah (ibn Masood) and was from Shiites of Ali, died in the regime of Sultan Abdul-Malik.

Further, Ibn- Hajar said in Taqreeb al-Tahzeeb (juz 1, pg 307):

زاذان أبو عمر الكندي البزاز ويكنى أبا عبد الله أيضا صدوق يرسل وفيه شيعية من الثانية مات سنة اثنتين وثمانين

Zazzan Abu Umer al-Kindi Al-Bazzaz and nicknamed Aba Abdullah also is Sudooq some times commit Irsal and has Shiite inclination died in year eighty two.

Ibn-Hajar and Dolabi both informed about the Shiite connection of Zazzan. The group of scholars, which support the believe of presented of deeds on Prophet, claim that Ibn-Hajar was influenced by Al-Waqidi. However there are evidences which support the inclination of Zazzan towards Shia'ism. Further it would be interesting to know that Ibn-Hajar has quoted Muhammad bin Umer Al-Waqidi more than 200 times in Tahzeeb al-Tahzeeb only. This basically reflects the acceptance of Waqidi in keeping the record of history.

It is reported in Shiitte text Al- Kafi H 1003, Ch. 93, h 2: Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from Muhammad ibn al-Husayn from Musa ibn Sa'dan from Abdallah ibn al-Qasim from al-Hassan ibn Rashid who has said the following. "I Heard abu 'Abdallah (a.s.) say, 'When Allah, the Most Holy, the Most High, would love to create the Imam He would command an angel to take a drink of water from under the Throne and his father to drink it and from this He creates the Imam. for the first forty days and nights in his mothers womb he would hear anything. After that he would hear the words. When he is born that angel comes and writes between his eyes, ". . .in all truth and justice, your Lord's Word has been completed. No one can change His Words. He is All-hearing and All knowing." (6:115) When the preceding Imam passes away a light house made from light is prepared for him and this light house he examines the deeds of the creatures. By this means Allah establishes His authority over the creatures."

This indicate that presentation of deeds in originality is a Shiite belief. According to Sahih hadith roaming angels are recording the people remembering Allah. Narrated Abu Huraira: Allah's Apostle said, "Allah has some angels who look for those who celebrate the Praises of Allah on the roads and paths. And when they find some people celebrating

the Praises of Allah, they call each other, saying, "Come to the object of your pursuit.' " He added, "Then the angels encircle them with their wings up to the sky of the world." He added. "(after those people celebrated the Praises of Allah, and the angels go back), their Lord, asks them (those angels) though He knows better than them 'What do My slaves say?' The angels reply, 'They say: Subhan Allah, Allahu Akbar, and Alham-dulillah, Allah then says 'Did they see Me?' The angels reply, 'No! By Allah, they didn't see You.' Allah says, How it would have been if they saw Me?' The angels reply, 'If they saw You, they would worship You more devoutly and celebrate Your Glory more deeply, and declare Your freedom from any resemblance to anything more often.' Allah says (to the angels), 'What do they ask Me for?' The angels reply, 'They ask You for Paradise.' Allah says (to the angels), 'Did they see it?' The angels say, 'No! By Allah, O Lord! They did not see it.' Allah says, How it would have been if they saw it?" The angels say, 'If they saw it, they would have greater covetousness for it and would seek It with greater zeal and would have greater desire for it.' Allah says, 'From what do they seek refuge?" The angels reply, 'They seek refuge from the (Hell) Fire.' Allah says, 'Did they see it?' The angels say, 'No By Allah, O Lord! They did not see it.' Allah says, How it would have been if they saw it?' The angels say, 'If they saw it they would flee from it with the extreme fleeing and would have extreme fear from it.' Then Allah says, 'I make you witnesses that I have forgiven them." Allah's Apostle added, "One of the angels would say, There was so-and-so amongst them, and he was not one of them, but he had just come for some need.' Allah would say, 'These are those people whose companions will not

be reduced to misery.'

Report of Ibn Majah Another false hadith

It is reported in Ibn Majah that Abi Fakhtah narrated:

حَدَّتُنَا الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ بَيَانٍ، حَدَّتَنَا زِيَادُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللّهِ، حَدَّتَنَا الْمُسْمُودِيُّ، عَنْ عَدِنِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللّهِ، عَنْ أَيِي فَاحِتَةً، عَنْ الْأَسَوِدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللّهِ، عَنْ أَيِي فَاحِتَةً، عَنْ الْأَسَوِدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللّهِ، عَنْ أَيْ فَالْحَنَّمُ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللّهِ مَصَلَّى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلِّمَ عَلَيْهِ. قَالَ: فَقَالُوا لَهُ: فَعَلَمْنَا. قَالَ: قُولُوا: اللّهُمَّ الْحَبْلُ صَلَوَاتِكَ (عِ) وَرَحْتَكَ وَيَرَكَاتِكَ عَلَى سَيِّدِ الْمُرْسِلِينَ وَإِمَامِ الْمُتَقِينَ وَعَامُ النَّبِينَ، مُعَمِّدٍ عَبْدِكَ وَرَسُولِكَ إِمَام الحَيْدِ، وَقَائِدِ اللّهُمَّ الْمُتَّقِينَ وَعَامُ النَّبِينَ، مُعَمِّدٍ عَبْدِكَ وَرَسُولِكَ إِمَام الحَيْدِ، وَقَائِدِ النَّهُمَّ الْمُحْتِدِينَ اللّهُمَّ عَلَيْهِ وَعَلَى اللّهُمْ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُمْ عَلَيْهِ وَعَلَى اللّهُمْ عَلَى مَنْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلِي اللّهُمْ عَلَيْهُ عَلَى اللّهُمْ عَلَيْهُ عَلَى اللّهُمْ عَلَيْهِ عَلَى اللّهُمْ عَلَيْهِ وَعَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ وَعَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ وَعَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَعَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُمْ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُمْ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَى اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهُ وَالْهِ اللّهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ اللّهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ اللّهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ اللّهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهُ عَلَيْهِ عَلَي

Abdullah bin Mas'ud (may Allah be pleased with him) said: "When you send blessings to the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him), send it well, you do not know that it may be offered to the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him)." Then teach us the prayer for the blessings, he said: Say:

اللهم اجمل صلاتك ورحمتك وبركاتك على سيد الرسلين وإمام المتين وخاتم النبيين محمد عبدك ورسولك إمام الحير وقائد الخير ورسول الرحمة اللهم ابعثه مقاما محمودا يغبطه به الأولون والآخرون اللهم صل على محمد وعلى آل محمد كما صليت على إبراهيم وعلى آل إبراهيم إنك حميد محيد محيد اللهم بارك على محمد وعلى آل إبراهيم إنك حميد محيد محيد كما The report contains narrator Sa'id ibn Al-'Alaqah (also known as Sa'id ibn Abu Fakhta). He is an unknown narrator. According to book Ikamal Tahzeeb al-Kamal fi Asma'a al-Rijal by al-Mughltai:

وقال ابن قانع: مات سنة عشرين ومائة وقال أبو داود: ليس بثقة.

The author says that the mother of Ja'dah bin Habeera bin Abi Wahb bin Amr was Umm Hani bint Abi Talib, i.e. Sa'id bin Alaqah Abu Fakhta is a freed slave of the Ahl al-Bayt. He narrated a tradition stating that deeds are presented to the Messenger of Allah, a concept that gained

૰૾ૺૺૺૺૺૺૺૺૺૺ

prominence during the Umayyad period. This narrative emerged primarily within Shiite circles, driven by a desire to propagate the belief that their leaders possess the discerning ability to identify true Muslims from others. This concept was not merely theological; it had political underpinnings as well. The Shiites, by promoting this idea, sought to legitimize their claim of spiritual and moral authority, particularly in determining the authenticity of one's faith. Furthermore, this narration was strategically used as a tool to fuel dissent and support the uprising against the ruling Bani Umayyah dynasty. It was crafted and disseminated with the intention of undermining the Umayyad authority, portraying them as rulers who lacked divine insight and moral discernment, thus justifying the need for a revolution.

Deeds presnted on the body of the Prophet

It is reported in Musnad Ahmed, juz 4, pg 8, Sunan Abi Dawood juz 3, pg 404, Sunnan Nisai juz 1, pg 101, sunnan Ibn-Maja juz 3, pg 447 that:

حدثنا عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا حسين بن على الجمعني عن عبد الرحمن بن يزيد بن جابر عن أبي الأشعث الصنعاني عن أوس بن أبي أوس قال قال وسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم : من أفضل أيامكم يوم الجمعة فيه خلق آدم وفيه قبض وفيه النفخة وفيه الصعقة فاكثروا على من الصلاة فيه فان صلاتكم معروضة على فقالوا يا رسول الله وكيف تعرض عليك صلاتنا وقد أرمت يعنى وقد بليت قال إن الله عز و جل حرم على الأرض أن تأكل أجساد الأنبياء صلوات الله عليهم

Narrated Aus bin Abi Aus that Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said Best of your days is Friday, on this day Adam is created and on this (day) he died and on this (day) there will be Blowing (for day of Judgement) and on this (day) their will be Shocks (due to day of Judgement) so increase your prays of blessing on me on this day, as it is presented on me. We said O Messenger of Allah but

how it will be presented on you when you would become dust means you disintegrate, said: Indeed Allah has forbidden Earth to eat the bodies of prophets peace be upon them.

The two important narrators are Hussain bin Ali Al-Jofi (حسين بن على الجمنو) and Abdur Rehman bin Yazeed bin Jabbir (عبد الرحمن بن يزيد بن جاير).

Imam Bukhari: has tracked this narration and state that this narration is not authentic. He said is in his work Tahreekh al-Saghir, juz 2, pg 109

Al-Waleed said that Adbur-Rehaman had a book which he heard and a book which which he had not heard and people of Kufa have narrated from Abdur-Rehamn bin Yazeed bin Jabir but he is (actually Abur Rehaman) bin Yazeed bin Tameem and not the Ibn-Jabir and (Abdur Rehman bin Yazeed) Ibn Tameem is Munkar-ul-hadith.

Imam Bukhari also said is in his work Tahreekh al-Kabeer juz 5 pg 365:

Al-Waleed said: Abdur Rehaman (bin Yazeed bin Tammem) had a book which he heard and another book which he had not heard.

Imam Darqutini said in his book Al-Illal juz 10 pg220

 $Imam\ Abi\ Dawood\ {
m said}$ in Sawalat Al-Ajari juz 1 pg 242

عن أبي أسامة آ حدثنا عبد الرحمن بن يزيد آ فهو ابن تمم. Al-Ajari said)I asked Abu Dawood about Abdur Rehman bin Yazeed bin Tammem and he said he is Al-sulami Matrook ul-hadith, narrated from him Abu Usama and committed a mistake in name and (Abu Usama had) said narrated Abdur Rehman bin Yazeed bin jabir Al-Sulami, and where ever comes from Abi Usama narrated from Abdur Rehamn bin Yazeed, that is Ibn-Tammem.

Imam Ibn-Abi Hatim said in his work Illal al-hadith juz 1, pg 197:

وأَمَّا حُسِنٌ الجُمنِيُّ : فَإِنَّهُ روى عن عَبد الرّحمِنِ بن يزيد بنِ جايرٍ ، عن أيي الأشعثِ ، عن أوس بنِ أوس ، عنِ النَّبِيِّ صلى الله عليه وسلم في يوم الجُمُعةِ ، أنَّهُ قال : أفضلُ الأيّام : يومُ الجُمُعةِ ، فيهِ السّعقةُ ، وفيهِ النّفخةُ وفيهِ كذا وهُو حديثٌ مُنكرٌ ، لا أعلمُ أحدًا رواهُ غير حسينِ الجُمنِيِّ وأمّا عبدُ الرّحمنِ بنُ يزيد لا أعلمُ أحدًا رواهُ غير حسينِ الجُمنيِّقِ وأمّا عبدُ الرّحمنِ بنُ يزيد بنِ جايرٍ

And Hussain Al-Jofai: he narrated from Abdur Rehman bin Yazeed bin Jabir, from Abi Al-Ashath from Aus bin Aus from Messanger of Allah peace be upon him about the Friday and repoted that best of days is Friday, in it will be Shocks and Blowing and that and that is hadith Munkar, I know no one report it except Hussain Al-Jofai and as far as Abdur Rehman bin Yazeed bin Tameem is concerned, he is Daif-ul-hadith whereas Abdur Rehman bin Yazeed bin Jabir is trustworthy narrator.

The conclusion is that the narrator Hussain bin Ali al-Jofai has intentionally changed the name of narrator to Abdur Rehman bin Yazeed bin Jair. This slight twist in the name of narrator is done to misguide people. In fact the narrator is different and both Hussain al-Jofai and Ibn-Tameem are weak narrators. Imam Ibn Abi Hatim had even called it Munkar narration i.e. one which is against Sahih ahadith.

Verdict on some other weak narrations

There are some other weak narrations reported on this issue and attributed to different companions. There analysis is as follows.

Narration of Abi Hurraira (may Allah be pleased with him): It is reported in Musnad Ahmed juz 2, pg 367

حدثنا عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا سريج قال ثنا عبد الله بن نافع عن بن أبي ذئب عن سعيد المقبري عن أبي هريرة قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم : لا تتخذوا قبري عيدا ولا تجعلوا بيوتكم قبورا وحيثما كنتم فصلوا على فإن صلاتكم تبلغني

Narrated Abi Hurraira: Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said: Do not take my grave as a place of fair and do not make your houses, graves and pray for blessings on me, from wherever you are.

It is reported in Muajam Al-Awsat by Tabarani, juz 17 pg 339

حدثنا موسى بن هارون ، نا مسلم بن عمرو الحذاء الديني ، نا عبد الله بن نافع ، عن ابن أبي ذئب ، عن سعيد بن أبي سعيد المقبري ، عن أبي هريرة ، عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال : لا تجعلوا بيوتكم قبورا ، ولا تجعلوا قبري عيدا ، وصلوا على ، فإن صلاتكم تبلغني حيث ما كنتم

Narrated Abu Hurraira Messanger of Allah said: Do not make your houses graves, and do not take my grave as a fair, and pray for blessings on me, as your prayers would reach me from wherever you are.

Also Tabarabi said after the narration:

.. this narration does not connect with Ibn Abi Zaib but only via Abdullah bin Nafay, taffarad (only reported by) by Muslim bin Amr. Haithami said (Majmae-Zawaid, juz 2, pg 292):

(may Allah be pleased with him) It is

୶ୣୖ

reported in Masnad Abi Yala, juz 14 pg $2\,$

حدثنا موسى بن محمد بن حيان ، حدثنا أبو بكر الحنفي ، حدثنا عبد الله بن نافع ، أخبرني العلاء بن عبد الرحمن قال :
سمعت الحسن بن علي بن أبي طالب قال : قال رسول الله صلى
الله عليه وسلم : صلوا في بيوتكم ، لا تتخذوها قبورا ، ولا
تتخذوا بيتي عيدا ، صلوا علي وسلموا ، فإن صلاتكم وسلامكم
يبلغنى أينما كنتم

Hassan bin Ali bin Abi Talib said that Messeneger of Allah peace be upon him said Pray at your homes and do not take them as graves and do not take my grave as a fair, pray for blessings on me and your prayers for blessings and safety reach me wherever you are

Also reported in Masnad Abi Yala, juz 1 pg 452; Musanif Ibn Abi Sheeba, juz 2 pg 150:

حدثنا أبو بكر بن أبي شيبة ، حدثنا زيد بن الحباب ، حدثنا علي بن جعفر بن إبراهيم ، من ولد ذي الحبناحين ، قال : حدثنا علي بن غمر ، عن أبيه ، عن علي بن حسين ، أنه رأى رجلا محيء إلى فرجة كانت عند قبر النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ، فيدخل فيها فيدعو ، فنهاه ، فقال : ألا أحدثكم حديثا سمعته من أبي ، عن جدي ، عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ، قال : لا تتخذوا قبرى عيدا ، ولا بيوتكم قبورا ، فإن تسليمكم يبلغني أينما كنتم

Ali bin Hussain saw one person who reaches to the cavity near the grave of Messenger of Allah peace be upon him and entered it and called , (Hussain) forbade him and said I narrate to you what I heard from my father from grandfather from Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said Do not take your houses as grave as your prayer of blessings reach me wherever you are

Haithami said Majam-e- Zawaid, juz 4, pg 7:

رواه أبو يعلى وفيه جعفر بن إبراهيم الحجففري ذكره ابن أبي حاتم ولم يذكر فيه جرحاً وبقية رجاله ثقات

... narrated by Abi Yala and it has Jafar bin Ibrahim Al-Jafari, Ibn Abi Hatim has talked about him and has not reported any Jirah and rest of the narrators are authentic However Ibn-Hajar quoted this narration and said (Lisan al-Mezan, juz 1,pg 249)

الله إبراهيم نسبه إلى جده الأعلى جعفر إن كان الخبر لجعفر ... probably Ibrahim has attributed this narration to his grandfather Jafar, if this report is from Jafar.

Hence Ibn-Hajar showed his disfavour for this narration in Lisan al-Mezan. Further it mentions about cavity in grave of Messenger of Allah peace be upon him , which is against the historical record available to us. There had never been a cavity in the grave of Prophet.

Narration of Hasan bin Ali It is reported in Muajam Al-Kabeer by Tabarani, juz 3 pg 82

حدثنا أحمد بن رشدين الممري ثنا سعيد بن أبي مريم ثنا محمد بن جعفر أخبرني حميد بن أبي زينب : عن حسن بن حسن بن علي بن أبي طالب عن أبيه أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم قال : حيث ما كنتم فصلوا علي فإن صلاتكم تبلغني

Narrated Hasan bin Hasan bin Ali bin Abi Talib from his father that Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said wherever you are pray for blessings on me as your blessings would reach me.

In Muajam Al-Awsat juz 1 pg 371 حدثنا أحمد بن رشدين قال : نا حدثنا أحمد بن رشدين قال : نا سعيد بن أبي رينب ، عن حسين بن محمد بن عيلي بن أبي طالب ، عن أبيه ، أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال : حيثما كنتم فصلوا علي ، فإن صلاتكم تبغنني لا يروى هذا الحديث عن الحسن بن علي إلا بهذا الإسناد ، تفرد به : ابن أبى مريم

Narrated Hasan bin Hasan bin Ali bin Abi Talib from his father that Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said wherever you are pray for blessings on me as your prayers would reach me. No body reports this narration from Hasan bin Ali except with this chain and it is only reorted by Ibn Abi Mariam.

Haithami said in Majma-e-Zawaid, juz 11, pg 29 :

رواه الطبراني في الكبير والأوسط وفيه حميد بن أبي زينب ولم أعرف، وبقية رجاله رجال الصحيح.



Narrated Tabarani in Al-Awsat and it has Hameed bin Abi Zainab and I do not know him, and rest of the narrators are from Al-Sahih.

Therefore the narrations are reported by an unknown narrator and thus weak. Narration Abi Masood Al-Ansari

Narated in Mustadrak: حدثنا الشيخ أبو بكر بن إسحاق الفقيه ، أنبأ أحمد بن علي الأبار ، ثنا أحمد بن عبد الرحمن بن بكار الدمشقي ، ثنا الوليد بن مسلم ، حدثني أبو رافع ، عن سعيد القبري ، عن أبي مسعود الأنصاري رضي الله عنه ، عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال : أكثروا علي الصلاة في يوم الجمعة ، فإنه ليس أحد يصلي علي يوم الجمعة إلا عرضت على صلاته

Abi Masood Al-Ansari said that Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said Increase your prayer of blessings on me on Friday, in fact there is no one who would pray for blessings on me and it would not be presented to be.

It contains Ismaeel bin Rafa who is a weak narrator. (From Tahzibul-Kamal, juz 3 pg 85) Yahyah bin moin called him Weak also called him i.e. He is nothing Ahmed bin Hanbal and Abu Hatim said: Munkar-ul-Hadith Nisai called him siqah once but also one whose narrations are rejected.

Narration of Annas

حدثنا أحمد قال: نا إسحاق قال: نا محمد بن سليمان بن أبي داود قال: نا أبو جعفر الرازي ، عن الربيع بن أنس ، عن أنس بن مالك ، عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: من ذكر الله ففاضت عيناه من خشية الله حتى تصيب الأرض دموعه لم يعذبه الله يوم القيامة وقال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم: من صلى علي بلغتني صلاته ، وصليت عليه ، وكتبت له سوى ذلك عشر حسنات لم يرو هذين الحديثين عن أبي جعفر إلا محمد بن سلمان

Anas narrated that Messenger of allah peace be upon him said One who talk about Allah until his tears go to ground due to fear of Allah, Allah would not torment him on day of Judgement and Prophet said whoever prays on me, his prays of blessing would reach me, I

pray for him and ten good deeds would be written for him

It contains a narrator Abu Jafar Al-Razi who is a weak narrator. His name is Essa bin Haman and in Doafa Al-Uqaili, Uqaili said (juz 3 pg 388) Ahmed said Not a strong narrator. Ahmed called him Muztarad al-hadith (Majroheen by Ibn-Habban juz 2, pg 120)

Comparing above narration with the Life of Prophet

The narrations of presentation of our deeds on Prophet and on our dead relatives are weak. The prayer for blessings on Prophet starts with words O Allah . How would angels detour and take the prayers to Prophet or dead Muslims?

- 1. Is it not the case that Prophet took the oath in Hubabiyah from Muslims over the news of Uthman's death. Uthman was not actually killed but imprisoned by pagans. Uthman could say prayer of blessings on Prophet and Roaming angels could have taken this to Prophet!
- 2. In Quran it is informed that there are Munafique in Medinah which no one knows except Allah and not even Prophet knows about them.

And among the bedouins round about you, some are hypocrites, and so are some among the people of Al-Madinah, they exaggerate and persist in hypocrisy, you (O Muhammad) know them not, We know them. We shall punish them twice, and thereafter they shall be brought back to a great (horrible) torment. (9:101)

But if the Roaming angels bring the prayer of blessings to Prophet, he could have known about the hidden hypocrites.

3. In Prophet's life time he sent 70 scholars of Quran to some community for preaching where they all were murdered deceitfully. When they were massacred they prayed to Allah OAllah inform you



Prophet. They do not need to say this had they have the belief of presentation of deeds on Prophet.

To get rid of these arguments the scholars who believe in presentation of deeds say that it is possible the presentation is started after the death of Prophet. But this reply doesn't help as in the narrations it is reported that companions asked how the deeds are presented after death when body is disintegrated. Also the role of roaming angels is described without the condition that this would happened after death.

Deeds presented on Deceased Relatives

The reports about deeds being presented to deceased relatives, have been subject to scrutiny. These narrations, reported in texts like Musnad Ahmed, Mustadrak Al-Hakim and Musnad Abi Dawood Al-Tiyalisi, suggest that the actions of the living are somehow witnessed by their dead kin. However, analysis by scholars like Dahabi and Ibn Habban reveals critical issues with the narrators' credibility, casting doubt on the authenticity of these accounts.

In this treatise it is exhibited that how the weak narrations of presentation of Ummah deeds on Prophets and dead relatives have been taken as an article of faith by some scholars. The presentation of deeds is not a simple issue. It is basically an intrusion in the Divine attribute of Omniscience (Ilm-ul-Ghayb) i.e. Knowledge of every thing. May Allah save us from all kinds of Sheerk (associating others the Divine Attributes).

As a Muslim it is important that we bring our believes in accordance with Holy Quran. May Allah send his blessings on our last Prophet Muhammad peace be upon him and guide us towards his mercy and Heavens and save us from Azab al-Qabr and Hell Fire. Amen