Azab al–Qabr

by

Abu-Shahiryar

www.islamic-belief.net

2013
Contents

• Concept of Death and Sleep
• How many deaths and lives are there for a human?
• Meaning of Qabr
• Azab al-Qabr (Torment in grave)
• Realm of Burzakh
• New bodies are given to soul in Burzakh?
• Narration on the returning of soul to dead body
• Endorsement of this narration by Al-Hakim (died 405 A.H.)
• Endorsement of this narration by Al-Dahabi (died 748 A.H.)
• Endorsement of this narration by Al-Baihaqui (died 458 AH)
• Narration of Byra bin Azib is against Quran
• Trustworthiness of Narrator Zazzan
• Narration from Heretics?
• Trustworthiness of Narrator Minhal bin Amr
• Rejection of this narration by Ibn-Habban (died 354 AH)
• Rejection of this narration by Ibn-Hazm (died 456 AH)
• Rejection of this narration by Al-Dahabi (died 748 AH)
• Narration with Nakarat
• Traces of Jewish thought in Zazzan’s narration
• Could we consider all narrations authentic by the narrators which are also the narrators of Sahihhain?
• When did Allah Almighty informed Prophet peace be upon him about Azab al-Qabr?
• Amr bin Abi Al-Aas’s will at death bed?
• Do dead hear the footsteps?
• Do all animals hear the Azab al-Qabr?
• Mule heard the Azab al-Qabr?
• Putting of green branch on the grave
Azab al–Qabr

All the praise be to Allah, we seek his help and apologize to him and find refuge in him from the mischief of ourselves and whom Allah guided none can mislead him and whom he sent astray none can guide him and I witness that there is no God except Allah and that Muhammad is his slave and prophet.

No doubt it is a fact that there would be a torment or pleasure after the death. However the majority of Muslims now believe that this would happen in the earthly abode of dead body commonly called grave. The concept of Azab-al-Qabr is clearly explained in Quran and Sahih ahadith that everyone would experience one death in this earth and that the soul once taken out of body would not be returned to the body till the day of resurrection. The body meanwhile would disintegrates and degenerates into dust. The torment or pleasure of any kind would be experience by soul in a new body.

Some scholars have made up a belief that the torment from death till resurrection happens in this earthly grave. First the soul would be returned to body in grave for questioning and in case of wrong outcome the body would experience hell fire in grave and soul would be taken back to Hell. There is no valid hadith for this belief and in reality this belief is conjured from the mixture of non-authentic narrations, as will be explained in this treatise.

The purpose of grave is to hide the dead as body would go into disintegration. It would rot and consumed by the insects and finally goes to dust. In Quran this purpose is first explained when Qabeel (son of Prophet Adam peace be upon him) killed his brother. In surah Al-Maidah (5:27-31) we are informed that:

And (O Muhammad) recite to them (the Jews) the story of the two sons of Adam [Habil (Abel) and Qabil (Cain)] in truth; when each offered a sacrifice (to Allah), it was accepted from the one but not from the other. The latter said to the former: "I will surely kill you." The former said: "Verily, Allah accepts only from those who are Al-Muttaqun (the pious - see V.2:2).". "If you do stretch your hand against me to kill me, I shall never stretch my hand against you to kill you, for I fear Allah; the Lord of the 'Alamin (mankind, jinns, and all that exists)." "Verily, I intend to let you draw my sin on yourself as well as yours, then you will be one of the dwellers of the Fire, and that is the recompense of the Zalimun (polytheists and wrong-doers)." So the Nafs (self) of the other (latter one) encouraged him and made fair-seeming to him the murder of his brother; he murdered him and became one of the losers.

Then Allah sent a crow who scratched the ground to show him to hide the dead body of his brother. He (the murderer) said: "Woe to me! Am I not even able to be as this crow and to hide the dead body of my brother?" Then he became one of those who regretted. (5:27-31)
Prophet also explained that all bodies would be disintegrated. Imam Bukhari, juz 16, pg 333, chapter باب (يوم ينفخ في الصور فتأتون أفواجا، زمنا) reported that:

4935 - حدثنا محمد أخبرنا أبو معاوية عن الأعشش عن أبي صالح عن أبي هريرة - رضي الله عنه - قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم - ما بين التفخينات أزغون - قال أزغون يوما قال أبنت - قال أزغون شهرا قال أبنت - قال أزغون سنة قال أبنت - قال ينفخ الله من السماء ما - فيتختون كما ينتفخ النفل ليس من الإنسان شيء إلا يبنين إلا عظمان واحدا وهو عصب الذنب ومنه يركب الخلق ينفخ القيامة

Abu Huraira - may Allah be pleased with him - said the Messenger of Allah - peace be upon him said- «What between forty Al-Nafkhateen (two blowings of Cnoch) ». (Inquirer asked) Forty days? he said can’t say this. Forty months? said can’t say this. Forty years? said can’t say this. Abu Huraira said (I heard from Prophet that) «Then God will send down water from the sky and they (humans) grow like (plant) grows_ There would be nothing in human but fret only one bone (remains) that is the tailbone, and on it ride the creation on the Day of Resurrection »

Bukhari has showed that all human body would be consumed by Earth except the tailbone. This shows that the body is nothing without a soul. The earth even consume the bodies of Holy Prophets as informed in narration of Abi-Yala, juz 13, pg 189:

Prophet said:  When Moses exited along Beni Isr ael from Egypt  he strayed path and said: What is this? Scholars said: Prophet Joseph  has took us an oath in God that we would not go out of Egypt, unless we take his bones with us. Moses said: Who knows where his (Joseph’s) grave is? They said: An elderly woman of the children of Israel (knew about it), he (Moses) reached her and said: Inform me about the grave of Joseph. She said: Give me a verdict (Promise) He inquired: What's your verdict (Promise)? She said: I (want to be) with you in paradise. He abhorred to give this promise to her until God revealed to him (Moses) to give her this verdict. (Finally) They reached with them to a Lake: The place of swamp water, she said: take out this water. They took out the water and extracted the bones of Joseph when bones reached to the ground the road was (visible) like daylight.

This hadith clearly indicate the even the Prophets bodies would be disintegrated by earth. Quran informs us that Prophet Bodies would not last forever. Allah informed us in Quran, surah Al-Anbiyah (21:8)
And We did not create them (the Messengers, with) bodies that ate not food, nor were they (last) forever.

Therefore all bodies would be disintegrated irrespective of Prophet, righteous person or evil doer. There might be some exceptions but that could be due to climatic conditions and weather, which is temporary effect. Bodies may also survive due to embalming or mumification procedures which are purely scientific methods of preservation. But even these procedures may help for some period of time and finally the bodies disintegrate and dust (humans) become dust!

**Concept of Death and Sleep:**

Before we go on and continue our discussion on Azab al-Qabr it would be necessary to first understand the concept of death in Quran.

1. In surah az-Zumar (39:42) it is informed that:

   >>Allah receiveth (men's) souls at the time of their death, and those that die not during their sleep. He keeps those (souls) for which He has ordained death and sends the rest for a term appointed. Lo! herein verily are portents for people who think deeply. (39 : 42)

   (Pickthall translation)

2. In surah al-Anam (6:60-61) it is explained that:

   >>He it is Who gathereth you at night and knoweth that which ye commit by day. Then He raiseth you again to life therein, that the term appointed (for you) may be accomplished. And afterward unto Him is your return. Then He will proclaim unto you what ye used to do. He is the Omnipotent over His slaves. He sendeth guardians over you until, when death cometh unto one of you, Our messengers receive him, and they neglect not.

   (Pickthall Translation)

   >>It is He, Who takes your souls by night (when you are asleep), and has knowledge of all that you have done by day, then he raises (wakes) you up again that a term appointed (your life period) be fulfilled, then in the end unto Him will be your return. Then He will inform you what you used to do. He is the Irresistible, Supreme over His slaves, and He sends guardians (angels guarding and writing all of one's good and bad deeds) over you, until when
death approaches one of you, Our Messengers (angel of death and his assistants) take his soul, and they never neglect their duty.

(Dr. Muhammad Taqi-ud-Din Al-Hilali, Ph.D. & Dr. Muhammad Muhsin Khan translation)

There are two important words in these verses. One is Tawaffa and another one is Rasala.

Tawaffa (توفى) in Arabic means taking something. In Quran it is used when God informed us that on the day of Judgement He Almighty would reward us completely. There the words Tawaffa kullu Nafas are used. Hence the word Tawaffa does not always mean death. Also God said to Prophet Isa:

إذ قَالَ ﷲ إِلَيْكُمْ أَحَدُ ﺗَﻮَﻓَّـا وَرَافَعَكُمْ إِلَيْهِ

When Allah said: O Isa I would take you and lift you towards me.

Here the word Tawaffa is used, which does not necessarily mean death. Therefore in the same sense the word Tawaffa is used in chapter 6 and 39 for the sleep. The sleeping person has all kind of vital signs i.e. breathing, sweating, dreaming etc. The soul is seized or held completely in the body. Sleep could be called the minor death in this sense. Death as a phenomenon involves the complete hold of soul. After death all vital signs will be absent.

Another important word is Rasala which has two meanings one is sending and another is releasing. Bukhari Hadith (juz 1, pg 4) explained this that when the angel arrived in the cave of Hira and asked Prophet to read.

فَأَخْذَني فَغَطَّئْنِي حَتَّىَ بَلَغَتْ مَنِيَ الْجَهَدُ ثُمَّ أَرَسَلْنِي فَقَالَ أَقْرَا قَلَتْ مَا أَنَا بُقَارِئٌ

He (angel) took me and (squeezed) until he reached my limit and then released me and said read, I said, I am not a reader!

These two examples help us to understand the meaning of the verses of (6:60-61) and (39:42). The soul is seized in the body at the time of death and sleep. Allah released the soul of living and does not return the soul of death. The words also indicate that unlike sleep at death the task is done via angels.

Some people try to insert confusion in the meaning of Death and Sleep. According to them the sleeping phenomenon is like the death phenomenon and accordingly a person experiences thousands of deaths when he or she sleeps over his or her life time. This is totally an ignorant and deviated understanding of these verses and concocted to fulfil some ulterior motives.

The body would feel any kind of torment until there is a soul in it. Allah has revealed in Quran that the people of Hell would cry for death and ask Malik- the Manager of Hell to grant them death.

لا يَدْعُوُنَّ فِيهَا الْمَوْتَ إِلَّآَ الْمَوْتَ الأَوْلَى وَوَقَافُهُمْ عُذَابَ الْجَحِيمِ (56)

They will never taste death therein except the first death (of this world), and He will save them from the torment of the blazing Fire (surah al-Dukkhan)

لا نَذْعَوْنَ الْيَوْمَ نَذِرًا وَاحِدًا وَاذْعَوْنَ نَذِرًا كَبِيرًا (14)

Exclaim not today for one destruction, but exclam for many destructions. (surah Furqan)
But those who disbelieve, (in the Oneness of Allah - Islamic Monotheism) for them will be the Fire of Hell. Neither it will have a complete killing effect on them so that they die, nor shall its torment be lightened for them. Thus do We require every disbeliever! (Fatir 36)

These verses clearly indicate that death would eliminate all sense of torment or bliss.

**How many deaths and lives are there for a human?**

Quran explicitly inform us that each breathing person would experience two deaths and two lives. Quran says in surah Al-Baqarh (2:28)

How can you disbelieve in Allah? Seeing that you were dead and He gave you life. Then He will give you death, then again will bring you to life (on the Day of Resurrection) and then unto Him you will return.

Further it is explained that people of the hell would call their Lord (Al-Ghafir 40:11)

They will say: "Our Lord! You have made us to die twice (i.e. we were dead in the loins of our fathers and dead after our deaths in this world), and You have given us life twice (i.e. life when we were born and life when we are Resurrected)! Now we confess our sins, then is there any way to get out (of the Fire)?"

Tibiri explained this in his exegesis on Quran as:

Abi Malik Al –Ghafari Al-Kofi said for verse You have made us to die and You have given us life twice that they were dead then Allah bestowed them life then they would be dead and then raised (again). (Tafseer Al-Tibiri)

This shows that each person would experience two deaths and two lives:

- First Death: is the realm of non-existence
- First Life: This earthly life now
- Second Death: The death experienced by a breathing person in this world
- Second Life: is the next life which would start on the Day of Judgement
Meaning of Qabr:

In Surah Al-Abbasa Allah informs us that every person would get a grave:

(80:17-22)

The above verses describe the acts of God with humans. As they go through different stages from conception till resurrection. All humans would experience these stages except few, like Jesus son of Mary born with Immaculate Conception without male intervention and also there were stories in Quran on the resurrection of a person before the final day of Judgement, which actually indicate the omnipotence of Almighty Allah. An exception is not a rule rather it’s a miracle. Therefore in the above verses it is described that every person would get an abode by Allah commonly called grave. All humans would experiences these stages and hence also received a Qabr!

Those who believe in torment in this earthly grave say that Qabr or grave is made in the earth for the body as Allah commanded his Prophet peace be upon him in surah Taubah, that he should not stand at the grave of Abdullah bin Ubai for funeral prayer.

(9:84)

And never (O Muhammad) pray (funeral prayer) for any of them (hypocrites) who dies, nor stand at his grave. Certainly they disbelieved in Allah and His Messenger, and died while they were Fasiqun (rebellious, - disobedient to Allah and His Messenger)

Obviously the dead would be placed in earth as instructed to us by Allah in surah al-Maidah (5:27-31). However this is not the place where the body would experience any pleasure or torture. It is not necessary that the Azab al-Qabr must be executed in the very grave of person. The term Azab al-Qabr is used as it’s a normal human practice that the dead are buried.

Scholar Ibn-Aqeel said (Talbis- Iblis by Ibn-Jouzi pg 106):

So in fact what had been reported on the bliss and agony of the deceased (one must) know that al-Idafa (of al-Qabr) refers to the bodies and the graves like an adjective (as if it is meant to be) said (that) person in grave- (Actually) The soul that was in this body is enjoying the bounty of Heaven (or) tormented in hell fire.

The statement of Ibn-Aqeel is self explanatory. The term Azab al-Qabr is used for the torment after the death till resurrection as a reference only. It is not necessary that torment must be executed in grave.
Azab al-Qabr (Torment in grave):

Quran informs us about the torment afflicted on the Pharaoh and his army in surah Younis 90-92.

And We took the Children of Israel across the sea, and Fir'aun (Pharaoh) with his hosts followed them in oppression and enmity, till when drowning overtook him, he said: "I believe that La ilaha illa (Huwa): (none has the right to be worshipped but) He," in Whom the Children of Israel believe, and I am one of the Muslims (those who submit to Allah's Will)." Now (you believe) while you refused to believe before and you were one of the Mufsidun (evil-doers, corrupts, etc.). So this day We shall deliver your (dead) body (out from the sea) that you may be a sign to those who come after you! And verily, many among mankind are heedless of Our Ayat (proofs, evidences, verses, lessons, signs, revelations, etc.).

Further in surah Ghafir (45-46) Allah said that:

So Allah saved him from the evils that they plotted (against him), while an evil torment encompassed Fir'aun's (Pharaoh) people. The Fire; they are exposed to it, morning and afternoon, and on the Day when the Hour will be established (it will be said to the angels): "Cause Fir'aun's (Pharaoh) people to enter the severest torment!"

Also it is stated for the drowned nation of Prophet Noah, that:

Because of their sins they were drowned, then were made to enter the Fire, and they found none to help them instead of Allah.

Both of these nations were drowned in water. None of them got the so-called grave as a final resting place instead we are informed that as soon as they were drowned the torment of Fire is started. Naturally torment has not happened here in earth, so then where it is ensuing?

Normally the scholar who support believe the returning of soul in the earthly also present the above verses as evidence of torment for dead before day of Judgement. We know that not every person gets the grave as some bodies are burned on pyre, some are scavenged by birds and some are drowned in the sea. Then how come a person receive this torment (Azab al-Qabr) if he hasn’t got the earthly grave?
Further evidence that this torment does not happen in this earthly grave is reflected by the following narrations:

Bukhari (juz 1, pg 165, chapter - ) reported that:

18 - Haditha reported that:

Narrated Anas: When the Prophet arrived Medina he dismounted at 'Awali-i-Medina amongst a tribe called Banu 'Amr bin 'Auf. He stayed there for fourteen nights. Then he sent for Bani An-Najjar and they came armed with their swords. As if I am looking (just now) as the Prophet was sitting over his Rahila (Mount) with Abu Bakr riding behind him and all Banu An-Najjar around him till he dismounted at the courtyard of Abu Aiyub's house. The Prophet loved to pray wherever the time for the prayer was due even at sheep-folds. Later on he ordered that a mosque should be built and sent for some people of Banu An-Najjar and said, "O Banu An-Najjar! Suggest to me the price of this (walled) piece of land of yours." They replied, "No! By Allah! We do not demand its price except from Allah." Anas added: There were graves of pagans in it and some of it was unlevelled and there were some date-palm trees in it. The Prophet ordered that the graves of the pagans be dug out and the unlevelled land be levelled and the date-palm trees be cut down. (So all that was done). They aligned these cut date-palm trees towards the Qibla of the mosque (as a wall) and they also built two stone side-walls (of the mosque). His companions brought the stones while reciting some poetic verses. The Prophet was with them and he kept on saying, "There is no goodness except that of the Hereafter, O Allah! So please forgive the Ansars and the emigrants."

The graves of idolaters were destroyed, which indicate that there was no torment or punishment in those graves, otherwise Prophet would not have done so.
Realm of Burzakh

Quran informed us that there is Burzakh (barrier) between the soul and this world.

```
الْمُوْتُ قَالَ رَبَّى اِنَّى ﻋَلَيْهِ ﻣَنْ أَطْلَقْتُ وَقَاتِلَهَا ﻭَمَنْ وَرَآئِهِمْ ﺛُزِّرَ إِلَى يَوْمٍ يُبْعَثُونَ

 Until, when death comes to one of them (those who join partners with Allah), he says: "My Lord! Send me back. "So that I may do good in that which I have left behind!" No! It is but a word that he speaks, and behind them is Barzakh (a barrier) until the Day when they will be resurrected.

The conversation between the soul and Allah Almighty is reported in above verses. Where the soul would like to go back? The answer to this question is: Obviously back to Erath!

Scholars have coined the name Al-Burzakh to refer to the realm where the souls would remain from death till resurrection. Ibn-Hajar Asqallani writes in his exegeses on Sahih Bukhari, titled Fathul Bari under the discussion on verse (juz 4, pg 443):

Al-Qurtubi said: the Majority takes that it (tormet to Aal-Firoun) happen in al-Burzakh, and is the proof of torment of the grave

In one hadith in Sahih Bukhari it is reported that Prophet Moses and Prophet Adam had an argument (Volume 8, Book 77, Number 611).

Narrated Abu Huraira:
The Prophet said, "Adam and Moses argued with each other. Moses said to Adam. 'O Adam! You are our father who disappointed us and turned us out of Paradise.' Then Adam said to him, 'O Moses! Allah favored you with His talk (talked to you directly) and He wrote (the Torah) for you with His Own Hand. Do you blame me for action which Allah had written in my fate forty years before my creation?' So Adam confuted Moses, Adam confuted Moses," the Prophet added, repeating the Statement three times.

Question arises that when and where this discussion happened? Ibn Hajar in Fathul Bari said that (juz 18/ pg 461)

أو كان ذلك بعد وفاة موسى فائنقتا في الْبَرْزَخ

.. or that could be after the death of Moses so they both met in al-Burzakh

Also Ibn- Jauzi proposed that (Fathul Bari juz 4., pg 443)

وَذَكَرَ إِبْنُ الْجَوْزِيّ اِحْتِمَال اِلْتَقَائِهِمَا فِي الْبَرْزَخ

Ibn Al-jauzi said possible met both in al-Burzakh

Ibn- Qutabah said in Taweel Mukhtalif ul hadith juz 1 pg 43

قال أبو محمد: ونحن نقول: إنه إذا جاز في المعقول وصح في النظر بالكتاب والخروج إن الله تعالى يبعث من في القبور بعد أن تكون الأجساد قد بلت والعالم قد رمت جاز أيضاً في المعقول وصح في النظر
Abu Muhammad said: we say: that in reasonable and true look and (we know from) book and news that God (will) resurrect people in the graves after the flesh has worn off and the bones disintegrated and (we also know from) reasonable consideration in the book and the news that they were tortured after their death in Burzakh. And in book Allah Almighty said The Fire; they are exposed to it, morning and afternoon, and on the Day when the Hour will be established (it will be said to the angels): 'Cause Fir'aun's (Pharaoh) people to enter the severest torment and He said Think not of those who are killed in the Way of Allah as dead. Nay, they are alive, with their Lord, and they have provision. They rejoice in what Allah has bestowed upon them of His Bounty, rejoicing for the sake of those who have not yet joined them, but are left behind (not yet martyred) that on them no fear shall come, nor shall they grieve. And this is something that Allah has singled out for martyrs of Badr may Allah mercy on them

These evidences clearly show that scholars had considered the Burzakh as a realm where torment could be afflicted and Prophets could talk each other.

Some scholar now claim that Burzakh is a figment of imagination. However they fail to understand that its only a term referring to the realm where soul would remain till resurrection. According to them the words زَبُّ ارْجِعُونَ (99) لَعَلَّ أَعْمَلُ صَالِحًَا فيما تَرْكَتْ indicate that the dead person would like to come back to earth and can do good deeds only in world and not in grave, therefore, these verses have nothing against the returning of the soul to dead.

However the same group of scholars who believe in returning of soul to the grave claim that a pious person may recite Quran in grave and may still does good deeds. They claim (on the basis on non-authentic ahadith) that after burial soul comes back to dead body and it says to angels, let me say my prayers. Is it not the case that Prophet instructed his Ummah (Bukhari Volume 1, Book 8, Number 424):

حِدِّثَنَا مُسْدِدٌ قَالَ حِدِّثَنَا يَحْيَى عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ قَالَ أَخْبَرَنِي نَافِعٌ عَنْ أَبِي عُمَرْ عِنْدَ النَّبِيِّ صلى الله عليه و سلم

 قال : ( اجْعَلُوا فِي بَيوْتَكُمْ مِن صَلَاتَكُمْ وَلَا تَخَذُّوهَا قِبْوَارًا )

Narrated Ibn 'Umar: The Prophet had said, "Offer some of your prayers (Nawafil) at home, and do not take your houses as graves."

The Prophet informed his Ummah that there are no prayers in grave.
New bodies are given to soul in Burzakh?

A question naturally arises that how the torment is afflicted if it does not happen in grave? There are several evidences that the soul is transferred to another body which experience all these afflictions.

Evidence 1: Souls with cheeks and head?
It is reported in Bukhari: 

Narrated Samura bin Jundab:
Whenever the Prophet finished the (morning) prayer, he would face us and ask, "Who amongst you had a dream last night?" So if anyone had seen a dream he would narrate it. The Prophet would say: "Ma sha'allah" (An Arabic maxim meaning literally, 'What Allah wished,' and it indicates a good omen.) One day, he asked us whether anyone of us had seen a
dream. We replied in the negative. The Prophet said, "But I had seen (a dream) last night that two men came to me, caught hold of my hands, and took me to the Sacred Land. There, I saw a person sitting and another standing with an iron hook in his hand pushing it inside the mouth of the former till it reached the jaw-bone, and then tore off one side of his cheek, and then did the same with the other side; in the mean-time the first side of his cheek became normal again and then he repeated the same operation again. I said, 'What is this?' They told me to proceed on and we went on till we came to a man Lying flat on his back, and another man standing at his head carrying a stone or a piece of rock, and crushing the head of the Lying man, with that stone. Whenever he struck him, the stone rolled away. The man went to pick it up and by the time he returned to him, the crushed head had returned to its normal state and the man came back and struck him again (and so on). I said, 'Who is this?' They told me to proceed on; so we proceeded on and passed by a hole like an oven; with a narrow top and wide bottom, and the fire was kindling underneath that hole. Whenever the fire-flame went up, the people were lifted up to such an extent that they about to get out of it, and whenever the fire got quieter, the people went down into it, and there were naked men and women in it. I said, 'Who is this?' They told me to proceed on. So we proceeded on till we reached a river of blood and a man was in it, and another man was standing at its bank with stones in front of him, facing the man standing in the river. Whenever the man in the river wanted to come out, the other one threw a stone in his mouth and caused him to retreat to his original position; and so whenever he wanted to come out the other would throw a stone in his mouth, and he would retreat to his original position. I asked, 'What is this?' They told me to proceed on and we did so till we reached a well-flourished green garden having a huge tree and near its root was sitting an old man with some children. (I saw) Another man near the tree with fire in front of him and he was kindling it up. Then they (i.e. my two companions) made me climb up the tree and made me enter a house, better than which I have ever seen. In it were some old men and young men, women and children. Then they took me out of this house and made me climb up the tree and made me enter another house that was better and superior (to the first) containing old and young people. I said to them (i.e. my two companions), 'You have made me ramble all the night. Tell me all about that I have seen.' They said, 'Yes. As for the one whose cheek you saw being torn away, he was a liar and he used to tell lies, and the people would report those lies on his authority till they spread all over the world. So, he will be punished like that till the Day of Resurrection. The one whose head you saw being crushed is the one whom Allah had given the knowledge of Quran but he used to sleep at night and did not use to act upon it by day; and so this punishment will go on till the Day of Resurrection. And those you saw in the hole (like oven) were adulterers. And those you saw in the river of blood were those dealing in Riba (usury). And the old man who was sitting at the base of the tree was Abraham and the little children around him were the offspring of the people. And the one who was kindling the fire was Malik, the gate-keeper of the Hell-fire. And the first house in which you have gone was the house of the common believers, and the second house was of the martyrs. I am Gabriel and this is Michael. Raise your head.' I raised my head and saw a thing like a cloud over me. They said, 'That is your place.' I said, 'Let me enter my place.' They said, 'You still have some life which you have not yet completed, and when you complete (that remaining portion of your life) you will then enter your place.'"

This hadith explicitly indicate that there is torment both collectively (like for adulterers) and individually (like for the Quran scholar and the liar) and the words يفعلى به إلى يوم القيامة indicate that it would happen till day of resurrection. Those who believe that the torment would happen only in grave claim that it’s a dream of Prophet and need interpretation which is not reported. Unfortunately they do not see the fallacy of their claim as we are informed that
Prophet was describing the dream in palpable manner and the dream was not metaphorical in nature. There were dreams of Prophet which were metaphorical and the dream was different from prophetic interpretation and reality. In fact there were dreams of Prophet which were clear and vivid and there are many examples of these kind of dreams in ahadith. For example Prophet saw in his dream that in Lailatul-Qadr, he would be prostrating in muddy waters and that happened exactly as it is. Similarly Prophet saw a dream in which he saw himself doing circumambulations the Kabbah. Prophet took it a direct revelation and set out for Umrah but pagans prevented him to enter Makkah, later Allah revealed that (in surah al-Fatah):

Indeed Allah shall fulfil the true vision which He showed to His Messenger [i.e. the Prophet saw a dream that he has entered Makkah along with his companions, having their (head) hair shaved and cut short] in very truth. Certainly, you shall enter Al-Masjid-al-Haram; if Allah wills, secure, (some) having your heads shaved, and (some) having your head hair cut short, having no fear. He knew what you knew not, and He granted besides that a near victory.

The present narration also reports the same kind of dream and that is why no interpretation is asked by the companions of Prophet. What is indicated in this hadith is that the new bodies are given to souls for the affliction of torment.

Ibn Hajar said in explanation of this narration (Fath ul Bari juz 20, pg 52)

And the narration has showed that some sinners will be punished in the Burzakh

**Evidence 2: Intestines of soul?**

Imam Bukhari reported in Sahih

1154 - حدثنا محمد بن مقاتل أخبرنا عبد الله أخبرنا يونس عن الزهري عن عروة قال:

قالت عائشة: خسفت الشمس فقام النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فقرأ سورة طولة ثم رفع رأسه ثم استفتح بسورة أخرى ثم ركع حين قضاها وسجد ثم فعل ذلك في الثانية ثم قال: إنهم آيتان من آيات الله فإذا رأيت ذلما فصلوا حتى يفرج عنكم لقد رأيت في مقامي هذه كل شيء وعدت حتى لقد رأيت أريد أن أخذ قطلا من الجنة حين رأيت عينها جعلت أقدم ولقد رأيت جهنت حطم بعضها بعضًا حين رأيت عينها تأخير ورايت فيها عمرو بن لحي وهو الذي سيب السوائب

Narrated 'Aisha:

Once the sun eclipsed and Allah's Apostle stood up for the prayer and recited a very long Sura and when bowed for a long while and then raised his head and started reciting another Sura. Then he bowed, and after finishing, he prostrated and did the same in the second Raka and then said, "These (lunar and solar eclipses) are two of the signs of Allah and if you see them, pray till the eclipse is over. No doubt, while standing at this place I saw everything promised to me by Allah and I saw (Paradise) and I wanted to pluck a bunch (of grapes) there from, at the time when you saw me stepping forward. No doubt, I saw Hell with its different parts destroying each other when you saw me retreating and in it I saw 'Amr bin Luhai who started the tradition of freeing animals (set them free) in the name of idols."
Also reported by Bukhari in \( juz \) 4, pg 1691

\[ 1887 \] - حدثني محمد بن أبي يعقوب أبو عبد الله الكرمائي حدثنا حسان ابن إبراهيم حدثنا يونس عن الزهري عن عروة أن عائشة رضي الله عنها قالت: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ( رأيت جهنم يحطم بعضها بعضًا ورأت عمرا يجر قصبه وهو أول من سيب السواب )

Narrated Aisha:
Allah's Apostle said, "I saw Hell and its different portions were consuming each other and saw 'Amr dragging his intestines (in it), and he was the first person to establish the tradition of letting animals loose (for the idols)."

In this report clearly a sign of new body are present. Amr bin Luhai is dragging his intestines in Hell. The soul does not have intestines. It’s a sign of a body.

**Evidence 3: Bird’s flight or soul’s flight?**

It is reported in Sahih Muslim chapter \( juz \) 3, pg 1502

\[ \] مسروق said: We asked Abdullah (ibn Masood) about the verse Think not of those who are killed in the Way of Allah as dead. Nay, they are alive, with their Lord, and they have provision. He said Indeed we asked Prophet about this he said: Souls are in Green bird, they have chandeliers hanging to the Holy Throne and they go in Paradise where they want and then return to the chandeliers, Their Lord is aware of them and said: Do ye desire anything? They replied (O Lord) anything we need! we go out in paradise where we want. Their Lord asked them same three times. When they saw that Lord would not leave asking them, they said, Lord, we want that our souls be returned in our bodies until we kill for the Way again. When he saw that they need nothing. He stopped asking them.

It is reported in Bukhari \( juz \) 3, pg 1360

 حدثني عمرو بن علي حدثنا يزيد بن هارون آخرنا إسماعيل ابن أبي خالد عن الشكـيـبـيـن: أن ابن عمر رضي الله عنهما كان إذا سلم على ابن جعفر قال السلام عليك يا ابن ذي الجناحين.
Narrated Ash-Sha‘bi:
Whenever Ibn ‘Umar greeted Ibn Jafar, he used to say: “As-salamu-‘Alaika (i.e. Peace be on you) O son of Dhu-l-Janahain (son of the two-winged person).”

The martyrs got new bodies which can fly. Scholars which do not believe in the new bodies say that green birds for the martyrs are like aeroplanes. They souls sit into these flying creatures. However the word ابن ذي الجناحين clearly contradict these assumptions. The wings are given to companion Jafar and that is why he is called the two-winged. The war of Mauta occurred in 8 AH, in which Jafar was martyred.

Evidence 4: Milk sucking soul?

It is reported in Bukhari juz 1 pg 465

Narrated Al-Bara:
When Ibrahim (the son of the Prophet) died, Allah's Apostle said, "There is a wet nurse for him in Paradise."

Further Prophet informed that his son Ibrahim goes to heaven where he has a body which could enjoy milk! Does the soul need milk?

Evidence 5 : Azab al-Qabr even before burial?

It is reported in Sahih Bukhari Volume 2, Book 23, Number 376 that:

Narrated 'Aisha (the wife of the Prophet) when if is reported to her that Abdullah ibn Umer said Indeed dead would be tormented for the weeping of the living (relatives), so she said May
Allah forgive Abi Abdur-Rehman (Abdullah ibn Umer) he is not a liar but did mistake or forgot actually Allah’s Apostle once passed by a Jewess whose relatives were weeping over her. He said, "They are weeping over her and she is being tortured in her grave."

Both of these narrations clearly indicate that the Jewess was not even buried but she was tormented due to weeping of her relatives. This indicate that the word Qabr in Prophet’s era actually refers to the abode in Burzakh.

The faction of scholars which believe in the return ing of the soul to dead claim that the narrators of this narration mistakenly dropped the word grave. Prophet had actually passed by the grave of a Jewess. To support their argument they present the narrations from Musnad Ahmed juz 2, pg 38, Sunnan Nisai juz 1, pg 262, Sunann Abi Dawood juz 3, pg 163 etc. However they forget that they themselves claim that any thing narrated by the narrators of Sahiheen is authentic. Are they not digressing from their previous claim?

In fact this narration is heard by eight people with the sanad (chain) of Hassham bin Urwa from Urwa from ‘Aisha with some variation of words. The most trustworthy among these eight narrators is Hammad bin Zaid, a very famous Imam of Jarah and Tadeel. He reported that the Prophet passed by the Jannaza (funeral bier) of a Jew!

Muslim juz 2 pg 642 chapter باب الميت يعذب ببكاء أهله عليه reported:

When Aisha was informed about the statement of Ibn Umer that dead are tortured due to crying of relatives, she said O Allah , Send your mercy on Abu Abdul Rahman, he heard something which now he remembered not. In fact Messenger of Allah PBUH passed by the funeral bier of a Jew and they were crying so he said you weep for him and he is being tortured.

This another narration of Muslim shows that the Jew was not even buried. The issue is not whether the dead person was male or female, the issue is whether he or she was buried or still on the surface.

These evidences made it quite clear that the Azab al-Qabr is executed in Burzakh and it has nothing to do with grave in earth.
Narration on the returing of soul to dead body

The narration which is presented for the support of wide held belief that the torment actually occur in the earthly grave is attributed to Byra bin Azib, a companion of Prophet peace be upon him. This narration is reported in Musnad Ahmed, juz 4, pg 287; Abi Dawood juz 13, pg 494; Ibn Abi Shibah juz 3, pg 310, Hakim juz 1, pg 37 etc with some variations in text:

- حدثنا عبد الله حديثي أبي ثان أبو معاوية قال ثنا الأعشم عن سهيل بن عباد عن رأى عن فلان عن عزاز بن عامر قال:

خرجنا مع النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في جنازة رجل من الأنصار فانتهينا إلى القبر لما يلحن في الجنازة رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ولحسن حروة وكان على روسنا رطب وقبلنا عليه ويدعو يبنك في الأرض فوقع رأسه فقال استعينوا بالله من عذاب القبر وقيل ثم قال إن العبد المؤمن إذا كان في النقطان من الدنيا وأيضا في الآخرة نزل إليه ملاك من السماء بيم الوجود كان ووجوه الشمس مظلم كن من أكثار الجنة وحول من حوال الجنة حتى يجلسون منه.

البشر ثم يجيء ملك المومياء بالسلاطين حتى يجلس عند رأسه فيقول إنها النفس الطيبة الأخرى إلى مغفرة من الله

ورضوان قال فخرج نقش كما ثبت القطرة في النبابة فأذنها فذاعبها لم يدعوا في بلده طرفة غير حتى

أتهموها فيجعلوا في ذلك المكتوب وفي ذلك الحين ويجعل منها كاف فف النطق الملائم في، Clause

ف laut FL 6 3

واسمهم الذي كانوا ينتمون بهم إلى الدنار حتى ينتهي بها إلى السماء الدنيا فيفتحون له فتحهم لهم ويشيره من كل سماء مقربوا إلى السماء التي تلتها حتى ينتهي به إلى السماء السابقة فيقول الله غ و جل أكبى كتاب أبيدي في عيين وأعيدوه إلى الأرض فإنه منها خلقهم ومنها أخرجهم ثار أخرى قال فقال رجاء في جسمه فيأتيه ملكان فيجلسانه فيقولون له من رك قبول ربي السماء فيقولون له ما دينك فيقول دنيا الإسلام فيقولون له ما هذا الرجل الذي

بعث فئة فيقول هو رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فيقولون له وما علمك فيقول فبرت كتاب الله قامته به وصدقت فينادى من السماء أن صدق عبدي فافشوا من الحلبة والبلسم من الحلبة وفتحوا له يا يا إلى الجنة قال فيئهم من روجها وطبعها ويفضح له في قبره منه إله رجل حسن الوجه حسن الطيبر طيب الريح فيقول أخبر بذي

يربك هذا يوم الذي كنت توعده فيقول له من نفتوجه الوجي بالخير فيقول أعلم كل الصالح فيقلو فيقوم بقم الساعة حتى أرجع إلى أهل و ما لي قال وان العبد الكافر إذا كان في نف자는 من الدنيا وأيضا في الآخرة نزل إليه سماء ملائكة سود الوجه منهم المسوح فيجسنون منه من البصر ثم يجيء ملك الموت حتى يجلس عند رأسه فيقول

أيها النفس الطيبة الأخرى إلى سخف من الله وغضب قل فقير في جسمه فينتهي كما ينزف السفود من الصوفر والحلب فأذنها هما إذا أنذرتها لم يدعوا في بلده طرفة غير حتى يجعلها في ذلك السماء

وعند عودة الأرض فصعدوا بها من الملائكة إلا قفعتها ما هذا الروح الحبي فيقولون فلان بن فلان يفصح أسسهم الذي كان ينتمي بهم إلى الدنار حتى ينتهي بها إلى السماء الدنيا فيفتحون له فلا يفع في لم فرأ رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فلا لقدت لهم آيات السماء ولا يدخلون الجنة حتى يلحن الجمل في سم الخياط { فيقول الله ع و جل أكبى كتابه في سمى في الأرض السقلي فطرح روحه طرحا ثم قرأ { و من يقول بقطع الكعب فإنه خبر من السماء فنحذوه الطر و أو رأبه في الريح في مكان مريح { فعاد رجاء في جسمه فيأتيه ملكان فيجلسانه فيقولون له من رك قبول ربي السماء فيقولون له ما دينك فيقولين له ما هذا الرجل الذي

بعث فئة فيقول هو رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم

فإنما في صوفر فينادى إلى الله حسن الوجه حسن الطيبر طيب الريح فيقول إنها النفس الطيبة الأخرى إلى مغفرة من الله

هاء لا أديي فينادى من السماء أن كذب فافشوا له من النار وفتحوا له يا يا إلى النار فيئهم من حرا وسمومها.
ويبقى عليه قبره حتى تحلف فيه أضلاعه. و يأتيه رجل فيح بقيه وجاء الطيبه متن الريح فيقول آشر بالذي يسوده هذا
يومه الذي كنت توعدي فيقول من أنت فوجهك الله يجي بالبشر فيقول أنا عملك الخبيث فيقول رب لا تقم الساعة

فيقبض له أصم أبكم معه مرزية ول ول ضرب بها فيل صار تابا أو قال ربما فيضربه ضربة تسمعها الخالائق إلا التقلين ثم
تعاد فيه الروح فيضربه ضربة أخرى

Byra bin Azib reported that we went out with the Prophet, peace be upon him at the funeral of a man from Ansar so we arrived at the grave and it was not ready; Messenger of Allah peace be upon him sat and we sat around him as if birds are over our heads and in his hands was a twig through which he was engraving on ground.

He raised his head and said: Ask forgiveness of Allah from the torment of the grave two or three times and then said that for the righteous person at the interruption of this world and the beginning of the Hereafter, came down the angels from heaven with bright faces as if their faces are sun. With them is a shroud of Paradise and shrouds of musk of paradise, they sit until the range of sight.

Then arrive the Angel of Death, peace be upon him until sits at his (righteous person’s) head and says, O good soul come out towards the forgiveness of God and His happiness.

He said: It come out flowing like flowing drop from waterskin, he (angel) takes the souls and it does not remain with him for an eye blink and the souls is taken from him by (other) angels. Then they adorn the soul with the heavenly attire and engulfed it into heavenly scent. A scent then erupts from the souls which smelled better than the Musk fragrances of the earth.

Prophet said: The angels (carrying soul) ascend towards heaven. As they passes by the schools of angels (already in heaven), Angels inquired: Which pious soul is this? They are told that he is that son of that. They utter his (dead person) most worthy name through which he is called at earth. Angels take him to the heaven and request that the doors of heaven be opened for it and doors are opened. Afterwards the angels of presence of each sky would accompany this soul until they reach the seventh sky.

Allah says:

Inscribe the book of my slave in Illiyen and return him to the earth as by it, I have created them and to which I would return them and brought them out at another time

(Prophet) Said: so the soul is returned in the body, and comes two angels to him which sat him. They also ask him: Who is your Lord? He says my Lord is Allah. They ask him: What is your faith? He says: Islam is my faith. They ask: Who was the person sent among you? He says: He (Muhammad PBUH) is the prophet. They inquire: How do you come to know all about it? He says: I read the book of Allah, believed in it and attested it. A voice then comes from the sky: My slave spoke truth so laid the floor of Heavens for him, adorned him in heavenly attire and open the door of heaven for him.

Said: The fragrance of heavens started reaching him and his grave is extended till the eye-sight.

(Prophet) Said: After that comes a handsome person, perfumed and beautifully dressed. He comes to the righteous person, with these bounties remain blissful, these are the tidings for you, this is the day promised to you. Righteous person inquires Who are you? Your face is
like blessings achieved. He says: I am your good deed. Then the righteous person prayed that O Lord establish the day of Judgement, so that I may return to my family. Prophet said: When the infidel leave this world and about to enter in hereafter, come the angels from heavens with black faces with jute rug. They sat with the distance till reaches eye slight. After that comes the angel of Death which sit close to his head and says O evil soul come out towards the wrath of God and His anger. Said: The soul then spreads inside the body, Angel of death then dragged it out like iron spike is taken out from the wool. As soon as angel of death took hold of the soul, come other angels and with in an eye blink took it from his hands and fold it into jute rug. From it (souls) erupts the most vicious of smells. Angels take it and ascend upwards, as they passes by schools of angels, they inquire: Which evil soul is this? Angels call the worst name of it, through which he was famous at the earth. Until they reach the first sky and asked for the door to be opened but it is not allowed. Prophet then recited this verse: The doors of sky would not be opened for them until the camel goes through the passage of needle.

Then Allah orders: Inscribe his name in Sijjeen, which is the under-world.

Then the soul is thrown down and Prophet recited verse whoever assigns partners to Allah, it is as if he had fallen from the sky, and the birds had snatched him, or the wind had thrown him to a far off place... Then his soul is returned to body and arrive two angels which sat him and ask: Who is your Lord? He says alas I know it not. They ask: What is your faith? He says: Alas I know it not. They ask: Who was the person sent among you? He says: Alas I have no knowledge. Then resound a voice from heaven He lied so laid the blanket of fire – open a door of Hell. So come to him the heat of hell fire and its stench. The grave is so squeezed that his ribs engraved into one another. Then comes a man with hideous face and squalidly dressed with stench erupting from him. He comes and said I want to give you the tidings of things which would make you sad. This the day- promised to you! Infidel inquired: Who are you, with such a hideous face full of evilness? He says: I am your evil deeds. On that he cried: O Lord Let not the Time (day of judgement) come!

(Additional part in some books)
.. Then appointed on him a deaf or mute with mace , that if he would strike the Elephant it would became mud or said dust, the strikes a blow which is heard by all the creatures except Humans & Jinns and then returned the soul (again to body) it strikes another blow.

Endorsement of this narration by Al-Hakim (died 405 A.H.):
Al-Hakim Al-Nishabori committed a mistake in endorsing this narration in his compilation Mustadrak Al-Hakim. Mustadrak Al-Hakim is replete with such mistakes and scholars over the ages have indicated these mistakes. Al-Hakim was a prolific author and has written many books. Mustadrak is a book which according to Al-Hakim contains narrations which both Imam Bukhari and Imam Muslims have not included in their Sahih or Jamah. Al-Hakim assuming that he understood the rules of selection of Sahih narrations by Bukhari and Muslim, compiled the Mustadrak. At several places he has written “on the conditions of both (Bukhari & Muslim) but they have not reported it” i.e. the said narration is fulfilling the conditions of Bukhari and Muslims but they have not included those in Sahiheen.

Such endorsements of Hakim are criticized by major scholars over the years see Nasb-ur-Raya by Zalai, Tazkira tul-Huffaz by Dahabi, Meezan Al-Ateedal by Dahabi, Lisan al-Meezan by Ibn-Hajar etc.
Al-Hakim said for the narration of Byra bin azib from Zazzan that (Mustadrak, juz 1, pg 51):

This narration is sahih on the conditions of both Sheiks (i.e. Bukhari & Muslim) as both have taken narrations from Minhal bin Amr and Zazzan Abi Umer Al-Kindi and it has many benefits for Ahl-Sunnah and suppression for heretics but have not included it due to its length

Endorsement of this narration by Al-Dahabi (died 748 A.H.):

Dahabi has written in his noting over Mustadrak (see juz 1, pg 51) that:

This is a mistake from Dahabi, as Muslim has not taken any narration from Minhal bin Amr. So the statement of Dahabi is incorrect.

Dahabi has written Seer-Allam Al-Nabla and Tarikh Islam after the compilation of his noting on Mustadrak. As he indicated that elsewhere.

Dahabi writes in Tarikh al-Islam Juz 1, 2942

And in all respect that book (Mustadrak) is a useful book I have shortened it and …

Thus it is clear from these excerpts that Talkhis over Mustadrak was compiled before the thorough work of Seer Allam and Tahrikh al-Islam

Therefore the endorsement of Dahabi for the Minhal narration as quoted above could not be taken seriously. In this later work he himself refuted this narration, as mentioned earlier from the references of Seer-Allam and Tahrikh Islam.

Dahabi said in Seer Aallam (juz 5, pg 184) compiled after his noting on Mustadrak:

I say: his lengthy narration regarding grave has Nikkarat (against established hadith) and Gharabat (uniqueness), which he narrates from Zazzan from Byra

Dahabi has refuted this narration in his later work and in a way cleared his position.
Endorsement of this narration by Al-Baihaqui (died 458 AH):

Al- Baihaqui had compiled a book on the narrations of Azab-al-Qabr. As such the book is compiled against the Mu'tazilah. Mu'tazilah was the speculative theology that flourished in Basra and Baghdad. Mu'tazilah theological school is traced back to Wāsil ibn 'Aṭā' (699–749) who was the student of al-Ḥasan al-บาšر. Mu'tazilah were the stalwart opposer of the idea that there would be any torment in grave. It was the kind of aberrant school indulged in philosophical details of Islamic thought and believe. They were the fore-runners of the so-called created-Quran (Khalq-al-Quran) dogma in era of Abbāsid caliph al-Maʿmūn.

Baihaqui has compiled a book titled إثبات عذاب القبر in which he has included 240 narrations about the torment in grave. Baihaqui has not given any of his opinions on the narration weaknesses as he did for his book on issue of recitation of Fatiah behind the Imam. Baihaqui said in this book:

قال عمرو في حديثه عن منهال عن راذا عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ففيت شخص له أصم أبكم معه مربية ولو ضرب بها فيل صار ترابا أو قال ربما فيضرب ضربة تسمعها الخلق إلا النفلين ثم تعاد فيه الروح ضربه ضربة أخرى

هذا حديث كبير صحيح الاستnad رواه جماعة من الآئمة الثقات عن الأعش وآخره أبو داود سليمان بن الأشعم

Baihaqui thus supported this narration.
**Narration of Byra bin Azib is against Quran:**

It would be necessary to analyse what is stated in narration instead of accepting it on its face value.

**Confusion over Illiyen & Sijjen:**

It is stated in narration that God commanded that:

> Inscribe the book of my slave in Illiyen and return him to the earth ...Inscribe his name in Sijjeen, which is the under-world.

Sijjin as an under-world has no basis in Quran and Sahih Ahadith. God Almighty informed us in his glorious book that Sijjin is a register not a place.

> كَانَ إِنُّوُّلَفِي سَجِينٍ (7) وَمَا أَذَرَاكَ مَا سَجِينٌ (8) كِتَابُ مَرْقُومٍ (9)

> Nay! Truly, the Record (writing of the deeds) of the Fujjar (disbelievers, sinners, evil-doers and wicked) is (preserved) in Sijjin. And what will make you know what Sijjin is? A Register inscribed.

Likewise Illiyen is the record of righteous people.

> كَانَ إِنُّوُّلَفِي أَلْبَارِ (18) وَمَا أَذَرَاكَ مَا عَلِيُّونَ (19) كِتَابُ مَرْقُومٍ (20) يَشْهَدُهُ اﻟْمُقَرَّرُونَ (21)

> Nay! Verily, the Record (writing of the deeds) of Al-Abrar (the pious who fear Allah and avoid evil), is (preserved) in 'Illiyyun. And what will make you know what 'Illiyyun is? A Register inscribed. To which bear witness those nearest (to Allah, i.e. the angels).

Unfortunately the group of scholars who claim that Zazzan narration from Byra bin Azib’s narration is authentic also sometimes claim that it is the name of place!

**Doors of sky would not be opened for Infidels**

It is claimed in narration that when the angels ascend with soul of evil-doer then:

> Until they reach the first sky and asked for the door to be opened but it is not allowed. Prophet then recited this verse: The doors of sky would not be opened for them until the camel goes through the passage of needle.

If this is the rule that door of sky would not be opened for a soul then why the same group of scholars (which believe in the returning of soul to dead body) claim that the soul after questioning in grave goes back to Hell! Does it mean that camel has crossed the passage of the needle? Actually there is a contradiction between their believe and what narrators are portraying. Narrators (Minhal bin Amr and Zazzan) would like to stress that souls after death remain in earth irrespective of whether the person is righteous or infidel.

**Complications due to Additional text:**

What these narrators are purporting is that the soul return to body does not happens only one times, rather it is an on going process. As reported in the *Idafa*:

> .. Then appointed on him a deaf or mute with mace , that if he would strike the Elephant it would became mud or said dust, the strikes a blow which is heard by all the creatures except Humans & Jinns and then returned the soul (again to body) it strikes another blow.
Since this (Idafa) addition is against the widespread belief that soul would be returned to the body in grave only once. It was necessary to refute it some how. Therefore the newly emerged so-called Salafi followers claim that this addition (Idafa) is not authentic. However their predecessors like Ibn-Tammiah quoted this addition twice in his Fatawah. Ibn-Qayyam quoted this addition in Kitab-ur-Ruh and the recent era scholar Nasiruddin Al-Bani declared this Idafa authentic.

Recently a group called Ahl-Hadith in Pakistan has refuted this Idafa claiming that it is not valid (see Al-Musnad fi Azab al-Qabr by Muhammad Arshad Kamal pg 152). However Mr. Arshad Kamal has blatantly used the endorsement of Baihaqui, Ibn-Qayyam, Al-Bani etc. (see Al-Musnad fi Azab al-Qabr by Muhammad Arshad Kamal pg 150-151) and hid the fact that these scholars consider this addition also authentic.

This Idafa is declared authentic by many scholars like

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. #</th>
<th>Scholar</th>
<th>Book</th>
<th>Juz/ Volume</th>
<th>page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Al-Baihaqui</td>
<td>Isbat Azab Al-Qabr</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ibn-Tammiah</td>
<td>Majmu’a Fatawah</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ibn-Qayyam</td>
<td>Kitab ar-Ruh</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Ibn- Tammiah</td>
<td>Mjumu’a Fatawah</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Nasiruddin Al-Bani</td>
<td>Sahih Targheeb wal- Tarheeb</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Nasiruddin Al-Bani</td>
<td>Ehkam ul- Janaiz</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Nasiruddin al-Bani</td>
<td>Mishtaak Al-Masabih</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Trustworthiness of Narrator Zazzan:

Imam Al-Dolabi has informed us in his work titled Al-Kuna-wal-Asma (juz 4- pg 404) that the Zazzan was among the Shiites.

Muhammad bin Umer (Al-Waqidi) said that Zazzan Abu Umer Al-Farisi Maula Kindah found (the era of) Umer and was among the people of Abdullah (ibn Masood) and was from Shiites of Ali, died in the regime of Sultan Abdul-Malik

The statement of Al-Waqidi is a historical record. Further, Ibn-Hajar said in Taqreeb al-Tahzeeb (juz 1, pg 307)

Ibn-Hajar and Dolabi both informed about the Shiite connection of Zazzan. The group of scholar which support the believe of returning of the soul into dead claim that Ibn-Hajar was influenced by Al-Waqidi. However there are evidences which support the inclination of Zazzan towards Shia’ism. Further it would be interesting to know that Ibn-Hajar has quoted Muhammad bin Umer Al-Waqidi more than 200 times in Tahzeeb al-Tahzeeb only. This basically reflects the acceptance of Waqidi in keeping the record of history.

Now here the narrations reported by Zazzan which reflect his Shiite tendencies:

1. It is reported in Fazail Sahabah compiled by Imam Ahmed (juz 2 pg 472) that:

   Zazzan said: I heard Ali in Al-Rahbah and he was preaching: Who saw the Messenger of Allah peace be upon him on the Ghadeer Khum? He said what he said? Stood thirteen men and bear witness that they heard the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him, he says: «If I am the friend of someone Ali is his friend O Allah, take as friend one who take him as friend and take as enemy one who takes him as enemy»

2. Also reported in Fazail Sahabah by Imam Ahmed (juz 3 pg 3) that:

   Zazzan said: I heard Ali in Al-Rahbah and he was preaching: Who saw the Messenger of Allah peace be upon him on the Ghadeer Khum? He said what he said? Stood thirteen men and bear witness that they heard the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him, he says: «If I am the friend of someone Ali is his friend O Allah, take as friend one who take him as friend and take as enemy one who takes him as enemy»
Narrated Zazzan from Ali that He said: I am in this nation, like a Jesus, son of Mary, A part of it loved him, and deviated in excessive love and angered a party and exhibited excess in abhorrence (against me)..

3. It is reported in Fazail Sahabah by Inman Ahmed (juz 3 pg 109) that:

Narrated the honest Qutaibah bin Umayah that I heard the Messenger of Allah peace be upon him says: « I and Ali were light in front of God, before Adam was created with span of fourteen thousand years. When God created Adam He partition that light into two parts, part I, and part Ali »

4. It is reported in Hadith Abi Fazl Azzuhri (juz 1 pg 107) that:

Narrated Zazzan from Salam that I heard the Messenger of Allah peace be upon him says: « I and Ali were light in front of God, before Adam was created with span of fourteen thousand years. When God created Adam He partition that light into two parts, part I, and part Ali »

The above narrations are the examples of Shiite tendencies of Zazzan. Not only that he is considered as an authentic narrator in Shiite literature like Usool-al-Kafi etc. Dr. Bashshar Awwad Al-Maroof have indicated that narrations form Zazzan is quoted in Shiite literature like the kafi in the cases and the hakam: 6. and the tahdid: 12.  and also in another book titled Muslim has quoted narration from Zazzan at three places. Bukhari has not taken any narration from Zazzan.
Shiite belief from Al-Kafi

Chapter 112
Climbing over the grave of the Holy Prophet (s.a) prohibited
H , Ch. 112, h 1
A number of our people has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-Barqi from Ja'far ibn al- Muthanna al-Khatib who has said the following. "I was in Madina when the roof over the grave of the Holy Prophet (s.a) had crumbled down and the workers were climbing up and down (for repairs). We were a group and said to our people, "Who has an appointment with abu 'Abdallah (a.s.)?" Mihran ibn abu Nasr said, "I have an appointment with the Imam (a.s.)." 'Isma'il ibn 'Ammar al-Sayrafi said, "I have an appointment with the Imam (a.s.)." I said to them, "Ask the Imam (a.s.) if it is permissible to climb up and look on to the grave of the Holy Prophet (s.a)." Next day we met them and we all came together. 'Isma'il said, "We asked your question and he said this, "I do not like anyone to climb over him and I do not feel safe for anyone whose eyesight may go away because of catching sight of something that cause him such loss or see him standing in prayer or see him with anyone of his wives."

Narration from Heretics?

In the era of compilation of books of ahadith i.e. Sahih Bukhari, Sahih Muslim, Gama-al-Tirmidhi, Sunan Abi Dawood, Sunnan Ibn-Maja, Sunan Nisai already several kind of heresies and deviated sects were present including Shiites, Khawarij, Mutazalites etc.

Scholars of hadith then developed the rules to write someone’s narration now known as Ilm-ul-Hadith (Knowledge of Hadith). One of its principal is that one should reject the narration if it supports the heretic believes of the narrator.

Qazi Abdul Wahab (القاضي عبدالوهاب) said (Tadreeb-ur-Ravi juz1,pg6) :

Do not take Ilm from four and take from others, (first) Do not take it from Heretic which call you to his heresy...

Uqdmah Ibn-Salah (pg 22):

Some scholar say) accept the narration if he is not heretic, and do not accept narration if he lead towards his heresy and this is the way followed by many or many of our scholars

There are several such quotations. The conclusion is that in case the narration is supporting some deviated faith, it should be rejected!

Although Minhal and Zazzan are narrators in Sahih Bukhari and Muslim but both avoided the narration of Byra bin Azib about the returning of soul to the dead body. Life in an earthly grave is an established Shiite faith. Both Zazzan and Minhal being Shiite have exhibited their faith in this narration.

Dahabi said in Seer-Allam Al-Nublah juz 1, pg 59:
Al-Dhahabi said: If the inquirer ask: how goes documenting heretic’s narration along with his trustworthiness, justice and confidence on narrator? How could he do justice if he is a heretic? And the answer is: that the heresey is of two kinds:

Minor Heresy: Like Shi’ism or Shiism without excess and distortion, and this has occurred with many of the Tabaeen and their followers in religion with piety and honesty. If we reject the narration (on these grounds) then a lot of prophetic Athar would vanish, and this is an obvious spoil! Then (there is) major heresy, like Rijdh as a total rejection and extremism, and degradation of Abu Bakr and ’Umar (RA), this sort of narrators does not deserve dignity and writing of narrations.

Trustworthiness of Narrator Minhal bin Amr:

The narrator of this so-called hadith, Minhal bin Amr is also considered as one having heretic believes. Imam Jozjani reported in his work Ahwal ur-Rejal

Abdurrehman bin Yahyah al-Muallami al-Yamani writes in his work titled juz 1 pg 150 that:

And many have tracked the statements of Jozjani for the shitte (narrators) but did not find them exceeding the limit, but the man (i.e. Imam Jozjani) because of the Nasab sees the Shi’ism as followers of bad (heretic) doctrine and going astray and elusive on the right and disappointment, the application of term on Shiites is what is deserved to them due to their faith (digressing on intent-bad doctrine), etc.

Dahabi has quoted in Meezan al-Atedal (juz 4/ pg 192) the following statements

And Hakim said: Yahyah bin Saeed reduced him

And Ibn- Hazm said likewise and has rejected his long narration on questioning in grave.
Ibn- Hajar said in Taqreeb Al-Tahzeeb (juz 2, pg 216):

المنهال بن عمرو الأسدي مولاهم الكوفي صدوق ربما وهم من الخامسة

Minhal bin Amr Al-Asadi … is Sadooq some times confused, belongs to fifth category

For the fifth category Ibn-Hajar described in Taqre eb Al-Tahzeeb:

الخامسة: من قصر عن الرابعة قليلاً، وإليه الإشارة بصدوق شيء الحفظ، أو صدوق يهم، أو له أوهام، أو يخطئ، أو تغيّر بأخرة ويلتحق بذلك من رقم ب نوع من البيعة، كالتشيع والقدر، والنصب، والإرجاء، والتجهم، مع بيان الداعية من غيره.

Fifth: which are reduced from forth and they are indicated by words Sadooque, bad memory or with Sadooque confused, Sadooque has confusions or commit mistakes or had amnesia in late age and afflicted with heresy like Shiite, Qadr, Nasb, Irj, Tahhajum with description of their heresy etc.

Bukhari has reported two narrations from Minhal, one is about a supplication and at another place the chain is quoted to support the main narration. Muslim has not reported any narration from Minhal bin Amr.

Rejection of this narration by Ibn-Habban (died 354 AH):

Ibn-Habban said in his Sahih ibn Habban juz 7 pg 374- [387]

قال أبو حاتم رحمة الله عليه خير الأعمش عن المنهال بن عمرو عن زاذان عن البراء سمعه الأعمش عن الحسن بن عمارة عن المنهال بن عمرو وزاذان لم يسمعه من البراء فلذلك لم أخرجه

Abu Hatim may blessings of Allah be on him said: Th e report of Al-Amash from Minhal bin Amr from Zazzan from Byra, heard Al-Amash (actually) from Hasan bin Ammara from Minhal bin Amr and (further) Zazzan has not listened (anything) from Byra, that’s why I haven’t recorded.

Rejection of this narration by Ibn-Hazm (died 456 AH):

وعلم برو أحد ان في عذاب الفقر رد الروح إلى الجسد الا المنهال بن عمرو وليس بالقوى

(Al-Muhalli, juz 1, pg 22)

None had reported that the soul would be returned to body for torment in grave except Minhal bin Amr and he is not a stalwart (قوى) narrator.

Rejection of this narration by Al-Dahabi (died 748 AH):

Al-Dahabi said in Tahrik Al- Islam juz 1, pg 894 that:

قلت: تفرد حديث مكر ونكر عن زاذان عن البراء

I say: he has Tafarud (unique in reporting) the hadith on Munkr and Nakeer from Zazzan from Byra.

In spite of these refutations there are clear opposition from the other faction of scholars like Hakim, Baihaqui, Ibn-Tammiah and Ibn-Qayyam.
Narration with Nakarat:
Dahabi declared that the narration of Byra bin Azib contains Nakarat which indicate that it is against the authentic hadith.

It is reported in Sahih Muslim, juz 4, pg 2202 that:

Abu Hurrirah said: As the soul of righteous man comes out then comes two angels in front of him and ascend him upwards. Hammad said then he talked about the scent and smell of musk and people of heaven said: A pious soul comes from Earth blessings of Allah be on you and the body which you have grown. Then angels take it to Lord All mighty and then (it is commanded) Take it till the final term. (Abu Hurrairah) said: and the Infidel when his soul comes out – Hammad said he talked about the stench and curse over it- and said: The people of heaven said: A wicked soul comes from Earth and (it is commanded) Take it till the final term. Abu Hurrirah said then Prophet peace be upon him covered his nose like this (i.e. to indicate the wicked soul’s stench)

This narration of Sahih Muslim clearly denounces what is stated in Byra bin Azib narration. The soul of Infidel also goes to heaven neither it is returned to body in grave nor there is the wrong application that soul of infidel would not go to heaven until the camel crosses the needle passage!

Traces of Jewish thought in Zazzan’s narration

The actual process of dying is stated in Midrash as following. The purpose of Midrash was to resolve problems in the interpretation of difficult passages of the text of the Hebrew Bible. The time of start of its writing is estimated to occur 505 CE by Jewish scholars, which is equivalent to 122 BH i.e. 122 years before Hijri calendar had started. Following are the two excerpts taken from a book written by a Jewish scholar Abraham Cohen:

The actual process of dying is described in this manner: ‘When a person’s end comes to depart from the world, the angle of death appears to take away his soul (Neshamah). The Neshemah is like a vein full of blood, and it has small viens which are dispersed through out the body. The angel of death grasps the top of this vien and extracts it. From the body of righteous person he extracts it gently, a though drawing a hair out of milk; but from the body of wicked person it is like whirlring waters at the entrance of canal or, as other say, like taking thorns out of ball of wool which tear backwards. As soon as this is extracted the person dies and the spirit issues forth and settles on his nose until the body decays. When this happens it cries and weeps before the holy one blessed be he, saying lord of the universe! Whither I am being led? Immediately (the angel) Dumah takes and conducts him to the court of death among the spirits. If he had been righteous it is proclaimed before him, Clear a place for such a righteous man and he proceeds stage by stage until he beholds the presence of Shechinah’ (Midrash to Ps. Xi,7; 51b,52 a) [from Everyman’s Talmud by Abraham Cohen Page 74, Schoken Books, 1995 ]

Also:
The opinion generally adopted was that the soul rejoined to the body for the purpose of judgement and it is expressed in this statement: ‘throughout 12 months (after death in Gehinnom) the body exists and soul ascends and descends, after 12 months the body ceases to exist and soul ascends without descending’ (Shab. 152b et seq.). [from Everyman’s Talmud Pg 376]

Now Zazzan’s description of dying process is:
When the infidel leave this world and about to enter in hereafter, come the angels from heavens with black faces with jute rug. They sit with the distance till reaches eye slight. After that comes the angel of Death which sit close to his head and says O evil soul come out towards the wrath of God and His anger. Said: The soul then spreads inside the body, Angel of death then dragged it out like iron spike is taken out from the wool. As soon as angel of death took hold of the soul, come other angels and with in an eye blink took it from his hands and fold it into jute rug. From it (souls) erupts the most vicious of smells. Angels take it and ascend upwards,…

The reader might be surprised to read this. What a similarity the Midrash passage has with Zazzan’s narration! One in Hebrew and one in Arabic. Reader must know that in the Talmudic era, this text is only available to Jewish scholars. It shows that there is a fabric of truth in saying that there are Jewish traces in Shiite thought of Zazzan and his student Minhal.

Could we consider all narrations authentic by the narrators which are also the narrators of Sahihhain?

This is a very important question. As same band of scholars which believe in returning of the soul in grave, forcefully portray it as a well established rule i.e. if Sheikhhain (Imam Bukhari and Imam Muslim) have reported from some narrators then it means that these narrators of Sahihhain are trustworthy and all the Jirah against them becomes invalid. (see Al-Musnad fil Azab al-Qabr by Muhammad Arshad Kamal pg 154)

This statement has no basis and acceptance among the hadith scholars. Mubarakbouri explained in Toffa-tul-Ahwazi, Juz 1, pg 253:

And the statement of Haithami that the narrators are trustworthy (siqa), does not indicate the correctness of narration, due to the possibility that it could have Mudlis narrator reporting with غنْعَة or could have a narrator with amnesia and he reports from the people, which he heard after this or it could have narrator which haven’t met or it could have narrators with Illah or shuzzoz. Hafiz Zailai says in Nasb-ur-Raya under discussion on some narrations related to saying of Bismillah loudly, that the authenticity of the narrators does not ensure the authenticity of hadith until it is cleared from shuzooz and Illah. And hafiz Ibn-
Hajar says on synopsis of discussion on some narration of trade that the trustworthiness (siqah) of narrators does not ensure that report is authentic.

Ibn-Hajar says in Nukat Ibn-Salah pg 22

I say: The presence of narrator of Al-Sahih in the chain of a report does not ensure that the report of these narrators is authentic, due to the possibility of Shuzzoz or Illah.

When did Allah Almighty informed Prophet peace be upon him about Azab al-Qabr?

The verses related to torment of fire for Pharoah and his army and also for Noah’s nation are revealed in Makkah. Bukhari (Volume 4, Book 52, Number 182) reported that during war of Al-Ahzab (i.e. the clans) Prophet peace be upon him said:

Narrated 'Ali:
Allah's Apostle said on the day of the battle of Trench they prevented us from performing the prayer (i.e. 'Asr) till the sun set. O Allah! Fill their graves and houses or bellies – forgot (narrator) Yahyah - with fire.

War of Trench took place in Zil-Qaadah 5 A.H. This indicates that the torment of grave for pagans was well known at that time. Also note that the pagans who were killed in war of Trench were not even buried. Were there graves of pagans in war zone? This again indicates that the word (graves) is referred to abode in Burzakh.

The torment on dead believers due to their sins is revealed to Prophet peace be upon him while his stay in Medinah. It is reported in Bukhari Volume 2, Book 18, Number 153:

Narrated Al-Mughira bin Shu'ba:
"The sun eclipsed in the life-time of Allah's Apostle on the day when (his son) Ibrahim died. So the people said that the sun had eclipsed because of the death of Ibrahim. Allah's Apostle
said, "The sun and the moon do not eclipse because of the death or life (i.e. birth) of someone. When you see the eclipse pray and invoke Allah."

Further in the eclipse prayer khutbah, Prophet peace be upon him informed the believers about the Azab al-Qabr for Muslims. It is reported in Bukhari Volume 2, Book 18, Number 159 that:

Narrated 'Amra bint 'Abdur-Rahman:
A Jewess came to ask 'Aisha (the wife of the Prophet) about something. She said to her, "May Allah give you refuge from the punishment of the grave." So 'Aisha asked Allah's Apostle "Would the people be punished in their graves?" Allah's Apostle after seeking refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave (and thus replied in the affirmative). Then one day, Allah's Apostle rode to go to some place but the sun eclipsed. He returned in the forenoon and passed through the rear of the dwellings (of his wives) and stood for the (eclipse) prayer, and the people stood behind him. He stood up for a long period and then performed a prolonged bowing which was shorter than the first bowing. Then he raised his head and prostrated. Then he stood up (for the second Raka) for a long while but the standing was shorter than that of the first Raka. Then he performed a prolonged bowing which was shorter than the first one. Then he raised his head and prostrated. Then he stood up for a long time but shorter than the first. Then he performed a prolonged bowing but shorter than the first. Then he raised his head and prostrated and finished the prayer and (then delivered the sermon and) said as much as Allah wished. And then he ordered the people to seek refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave.

It is reported in Bukhari Volume 1, Book 3, Number 86 that:

Narrated Asma:
I came to 'Aisha while she was praying, and said to her, "What has happened to the people?" She pointed out towards the sky. (I looked towards the mosque), and saw the people offering the prayer. Aisha said, "Subhan Allah." I said to her, "Is there a sign?" She nodded with her head meaning, "Yes." I, too, then stood (for the prayer of eclipse) till I became (nearly) unconscious and later on I poured water on my head. After the prayer, the Prophet praised and glorified Allah and then said,

"Just now at this place I have seen what I have never seen before, including Paradise and Hell. No doubt it has been inspired to me that you will be put to trials in your graves and these trials will be like the trials of Masiah-ad-Dajjal or nearly like it (the sub narrator is not sure which expression Asma’ used). You will be asked, 'What do you know about this man (the Prophet Muhammad)?' Then the faithful believer (or Asma’ said a similar word) will reply, 'He is Muhammad Allah’s Apostle who had come to us with clear evidences and guidance and so we accepted his teachings and followed him. And he is Muhammad.' And he will repeat it thrice. Then the angels will say to him, 'Sleep in peace as we have come to know that you were a faithful believer.' On the other hand, a hypocrite or a doubtful person will reply, 'I do not know, but I heard the people saying something and so I said it.' (the same)."

From these ahadith it is clear that the torment of grave for Muslims is revealed to Prophet on the day of death of his son Ibrahim. Ibrahim (son of Prophet) died in 10 AH. It is reported that on his death’s day solar eclipse has occurred, which people thought that occurred due to Prophet’s son’s demise. On that day the Prophet informed the Ummah about the trial of grave.
Based on this evidence from Sahih Bukhari we would now analyze different narrations
normally quoted in support of Azab al-Qabr in worldly grave.

**Extension of grave of Abi-Salma (RA):**

It is reported by Muslim that companion of Prophet Abi Salamh died and Prophet prayed for

Abi Qalabah about a companion named Abi Eisha (RA): Prophet peace be upon him prayed: When the soul is taken away the sight follows it. Some of the people of his family wept and wailed. So he said: Do not supplicate for yourselves anything but good, for angels say "Amen" to what you say. Then he said: O Allah, forgive Abu Salama, raise his degree among those who are rightly guided, grant him a successor in his descendants who remain. Forgive us and him, O Lord of the Universe, and make his grave spacious, and grant him light in it.

Umm Salama reported: The Messenger of Allah came to Abu Salama (as he died). His eyes were open. He closed them, and then said: When the soul is taken away the sight follows it. Some of the people of his family wept and wailed. So he said: Do not supplicate for yourselves anything but good, for angels say "Amen" to what you say. Then he said: O Allah, forgive Abu Salama, raise his degree among those who are rightly guided, grant him a successor in his descendants who remain. Forgive us and him, O Lord of the Universe, and make his grave spacious, and grant him light in it.

Abi Salmah died in 4 A.H. due to wounds inflicted in Uhud. This shows that the Qabr and its expansion was well known before 10 A.H. Further Abi Salamh was not yet buried but the Prophet prayed for his grave expansion, as if, Abi salamah is already buried. This shows that the Qabr is the abode in Burzakh.

**Saad bin Muaz and Azab al-Qabr ?**

A notable companion of Prophet is Saad bin Muaz. He died due to wounds afflicted in Khandaq (5 AH). Scholar who believe that soul is returned to dead in grave claim that grave has squeezed Saad bin Muaz. (sunnan Nisai, chapter

Ibn-Umer narrated that Prophet peace be upon him said: He is the person for whom the Throne moved and the doors of Heaven opened and seventy thousand angels visited and also indeed it (grave) squeezed then it (torment) is released.

Sadly this narration is also reported by same faction of scholars who believe in returning of the soul to dead as an evidence of Azab al-Qabr. Saad bin Muaz, may Allah be pleased with him, was a glorious companion of the Prophet peace be upon him, If he had died due to
wounds afflicted to him in war with pagans then he is a martyr, and Paradise would be his final abode. Chronologically speaking Prophet doesn’t know about the Azab al-Qabr for Muslims before 10 A.H. then how could he say this? Therefore on these technical fallacies this narration could not be accepted on the surface value.

Amr bin Abi Al-Aas’s will at death bed?

It is reported in Sahih Muslim chapter باب كون الإسلام بهدم ما قبله وكذا الهجرة والحج

Abur-Rehaman bin Shamasa Al-Mahri said: We attended Amr Ibn al-‘Aas and he was about to expire. He wept for a long time and turned his face towards wall (i.e. not looking at narrator). His son said O father how was your partnership with Messenger of Allah peace be upon him- (then he talked about the his Jahaliah days)......(finally Amr said)

When you bury me in the dust then wait on my grave, as much as, you slaughter a camel and divide the meat and I feel comfortable with you and see what shall I reply to angels of my Lord.

It is informed that Amir bin Abi Aas was in state of النوم about to expire. In that state sometimes people say things which are not clear and palpable. This narration only shows that Amir bin Abi Aas has said something on his death bed which is not instructed to us by
Messenger of Allah and hence is an innovation in Islam. As a companion he could not command us to do such an act. One scholar of recent era said, when asked about this narration:

هذا أوصي به عمرو بن العاص. رضي الله عنه. فقال: «أقيموا حول قبري قدر ما تنظر جزور وتقسم لحمها»، لكن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم لم يرشد إله الأمة. ولم يفعل الصحابة. رضي الله عنهم. فيما نعلم

This was willed by Amr bin Al-Aas may Allah be pleased with him, he said wait on my grave of as much as you slaughter a camel and divide the meat, but Neither the Prophet guided the Ummah, nor his companions did that as we know...

(مجموعة أسئلة تهم الأسرة المسلمة)

Do dead hear the footsteps?

It is reported in Bukhari that

حدثنا عياش حدثنا عبد الأعلى حدثنا سعود قال وقال لي خليفة حدثنا ابن زريع حدثنا سعيد عن قوله عن أنس رضي الله عنه عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: ( العبد إذا وضع في قبره وتوى وذهب أصحابه حتى إنه ليسسمع قرع تعالهم أتاه ملكان فأقعداهما فيقولان له ما كنت تقول في هذا الرجل محمد صلى الله عليه وسلم ؟ فيقول أشهد أنه عبد الله ورسوله فيقال انظر إلى مقعدك في النار أبدين الله به مقعدا من الجنة ). قال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم: ( فرادها جميعا وأما الكافر أو المنافق فيقول لا أدنى كنت أقول ما يقول الناس. فيقال لا دريت ولا تلبث ثم يضرب بطرقة من حديد ضربة بين أذنيه يصبح صحيحة

يمسمها من يلبه إلا التقلين

Narrated Anas:
The Prophet said, "When the slave (of Allah) is laid in his grave and his companions went away, until. Indeed he hears the footsteps, arrive two angels to him and make him sit and ask him: What did you use to say about this man, Muhammad ? He will say: I testify that he is Allah's slave and His Apostle. Then it will be said to him, 'Look at your place in the Hell-Fire. Allah has given you a place in Paradise instead of it.' " The Prophet added, "The dead person will see both his places. But a non-believer or a hypocrite will say to the angels, 'I do not know, but I used to say what the people used to say! It will be said to him, 'Neither did you know nor did you take the guidance (by reciting the Quran).’ Then he will be hit with an iron hammer between his two ears, and he will cry and that cry will be heard by whatever approaches him except human beings and jinns."
The interpretation of this hadith in accordance with Quran is that the footsteps are that of angels not the people who had just buried him.

Al-Zain bin Al-Muneer (الزَّيْن بن المُنِير) said (Sharah Ibn-Hajar, juz 4 pg 401)

وَكَانَهُ اقْتَطَعَ مَا هُوَ مِنْ سَمَاعِ الأَدْمِيَّينِ مِنْ سَمَاعِ مَا هُوَ مِنْ السَّمَاعِ

And like hear from Angels (footsteps) like what (he used to) hear from humans’ (footsteps)

Also, Al-Muhlab said (Sharah Ibn- Battal, juz 5, pg 355) that word من يلَّه إِلا النَّفَلِين (which approaches him except humans and jinns) actually mean هم الملائكة الذين يلون فتنه the angels which came for questioning. Therefore the only logical interpretation of this narration is that the dead hear the footsteps of angels, they question him and in case of wrong answer torture it and this cry is heard by angels themselves.

Unfortunately the scholars who believe in returning of the soul also claim that this narration is about the hearing of footsteps of people, not of angels. However they themselves claim that Amr bin Abi Al-Aas will is also in accordance with Quran i.e. When you bury me in the dust then wait on my grave, as much as, you slaughter a camel and divide the meat and I feel comfortable with you and see what shall I reply to angels of my Lord. The narration of footsteps and that of will of Amr bin Abi al-Aas are both contradictory. One claims that the dead would hear when people who have buried it would be leaving, whereas, another one claims that the dead even knows who is standing at the grave and questions of angels are replied in the presence of people, who have just buried it!

Do all animals hear the Azab al-Qabr?

It is reported in Bukhari (also mention earlier) that

Narrated 'Amra bint 'Abdur-Rahman:
A Jewess came to ask 'Aisha (the wife of the Prophet) about something. She said to her, "May Allah give you refuge from the punishment of the grave." So 'Aisha ' asked Allah's Apostle "Would the people be punished in their graves?" Allah's Apostle after seeking refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave (and thus replied in the affirmative). Then one day, Allah's Apostle rode to go to some place but the sun eclipsed. He returned in the forenoon and passed through the rear of the dwellings (of his wives) and stood for the (eclipse) prayer, and the people stood behind him. He stood up for a long period and then performed a prolonged bowing which was shorter than the first bowing. Then he raised his head and prostrated. Then he stood up (for the second Raka) for a long while but the standing was shorter than that of the first Raka. Then he performed a prolonged bowing which was shorter than the first one. Then he raised his head and prostrated. Then he stood up for a long time but shorter than the first. Then he performed a prolonged bowing but shorter than the first. Then he raised his head and prostrated and finished the prayer and (then delivered the sermon and)
said as much as Allah wished. And then he ordered the people to seek refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave.

Also reported in Bukhari (Volume 8, Book 75, Number 377)

Narrated Aisah:
Two old ladies from among the Jewish ladies entered upon me and said: "The dead are punished in their graves," but I thought they were telling a lie and did not believe them in the beginning. When they went away and the Prophet entered upon me, I said, "O Allah's Apostle! Two old ladies.." and told him the whole story. He said, "They told the truth; the dead are really punished, to the extent that all the animals hear (the sound resulting from) their punishment." Since then I always saw him seeking refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave in his prayers.

The narration is actually a short version of what reported in the long narration. The narrators have shortened many things. First in the short version it is reported, as if, Aisha may Allah be pleased with her was unaware of Azab al-qabr completely, in spite, of the fact that all verses related to Azab al-Qabr are already revealed in Quran and from the context of this event it is clear that this incident took place in year 10 A.H. In the long version the situation is different, there the Jewess warned her against Azab al-Qabr and at that moment there was no information for the punishment of grave for Muslims as such.

The second issue is that the Prophet has immediately endorsed what Jewess had said although we know that there was a time lapse between the revelation of punishment of grave for Muslims to Prophet and this conversation of Aisha (may Allah be pleased with her) and Jewess. It is reported in Sahih Muslim chapter باب استجابة النعوذ من عذاب القبر

Bab استجابة النعوذ من عذاب القبر

Entered (in house) the Messenger of Allah peace be upon him and a Jewish woman was with me and She (Jewess) said have you ever realised that you would be questioned in graves? (Aisha) She said Messenger of Allah peace be upon him is horrified by this and said but Jews would be tormented She (Aisah) said after that lapsed some nights and then Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said Have you realised that I have been revealed that you (people)
will be questioned in the graves? She (Aisha) said from then on I heard the Messenger of Allah peace be upon him seek refuge from the torment of the grave

The words in long narration in Bukhari (After that one day) and narration in Muslim (after that lapsed some nights) indicate that there was a time lapse involved before the revelation of torment in grave for Muslims.

Considering all these ahadith it is clear that narrators (of short narration of Bukhari) have shortened themselves the long narration reported in Muslim and Bukhari and thus committed a mistake in understanding. On the other hand this is the only narration in Bukhari which suggests that all animals hear the torment in grave. If for a moment we assume that dead are punished in graves in this world then this world is full of dead from Prophet Adam peace be upon him till today. Animals might be hearing the torture of dead and for any moment hear the billions of cries, screams and shrieks. Therefore as such it should be a norm for them however following narration contradicts it completely.

Mule heard the Azab al-Qabr?
It is reported in Muslim chapter

Narrated Zaid bin Thabit:
Prophet peace and blessings on him was riding a mule, moving along the wall of Bani al-Najjar and we (walking ) with him, that his mule shied and he (Prophet) was about to be demounted and there were graves of six or five or four (as stated by al-Jariri) so he asked who knows about people of these graves? One person said I know. He (Prophet) asked when they died? Said died in polytheism (as their belief) so Prophet said: Indeed this Ummah...
would be questioned in their graves as it is not (the case) that you would not bury your dead I call God to hear you from the torment of the grave, which I heard from them. He then looked at us and said Seek the protection of Allah from the torment of the fire we said we seek refuge with Allah from the torment of the fire, said Seek the protection of Allah from the torment of the grave we said we seek refuge with Allah from the torment of the grave said Seek the protection of God from the temptations and hidden We said we seek refuge with Allah from temptations and hidden Said Seek the protection of God from Dajjal Fitnah we said We seek refuge of Allaah from Dajjal Fitnah.

It is extracted from this hadith the torment was actually happening in these graves otherwise Prophet peace be upon him could not have said so. Before discussion on this narration it would interesting to remind the reader that Prophet himself had exhumed the pagans from the very site of Masjid un Nabi and destroyed the graves as mentioned earlier. Why he did that which would contract this report. The prophetic duty was to inculcate the fear of Allah in hearts of his Ummah and these words only reflect that intention. Some times in Arabic the negation is bought earlier to stress the importance of what would be said following as

It is reported in Musnad Abi Yala, juz 5, pg 248 that Prophet said:

ًأَلَمْ أَخَبُرَتُكُمْ مِنْ أَهْلِ النَّارِ حَتَّىٰ تَفَرَّقُوهُمْ ، ِعَندَ اَلْمَوْتِ وَلَوْ أَمَرْتَ أَفْعَلْتُهُمْ

It is not (the case) that you would not bury your dead I would have informed you about those who would fill into Hell Fire among you until you get separated (from them) on death, if I had been commanded to do so I might have done so

It is reported that Muslims would not bury the people of Hell among them, if they knew about them. This narration shows that the torment in grave has nothing to do with graves. Both narrations (of Muslim and Abi-Yala) start with phrase فلولاً أن لا تدافنوا but convey opposite meaning. The phrase is thus not conveying that torment in graves actually occur in very grave of a person.

A similar style is present in Quran where Allah Almighty has instructed us that

ٌإِلاَّ أَنْ تَمُوتُنَّ ﻓَإِنَّ تَمُوتُنَّ نَفَلَاءُ

then die not except in the Faith of Islam (2:132)

Ibn-Manzoor says in Lisan-al-Arab, juz 2, pg 90:

قَالَ أَبُو إِسْحَاقُ إِنْ قَالَ قَالَ ﻓِي اَلْكَلامِ كَيْفِ يَنْهَىَهُمْ عَنِ اَلْمَوْتِ وَهُمْ إِنَّمَا يَنْهَىَهُمْ ؟ قَبْلَ إِنَّا ﻓَقِيتُهَا ﻋَلَى سَعَةِ اَلْكَلامِ وَمَا ﺗُكْثِرُ اَلْأَرَبَّ اِسْتَعْمَالَهُ ﻗَالُ وَالْمَعْيِ ﺍَلْبَنَاءِ الإسلام

Abu Ishaq said if the inquirer ask, how one may escape from death and in fact they are died (not themselves)? Said it occurs due to extent of speech and used extensively by Arabs in their language and meaning is make Islam compulsory
**Putting of green branch on the grave**

It is reported in Bukhari, Book 8, Volume 73, Hadith 78: Good Manners and Form:

Narrated Ibn ‘Abbas: Allah’s Apostle passed by two graves and said, "Both of them (persons in the grave) are being tortured, and they are not being tortured for a major sin. This one used not to save himself from being soiled with his urine, and the other used to go about with calumnies (among the people to rouse hostilities, e.g., one goes to a person and tells him that so-and-so says about him such-and-such evil things). The Prophet then asked for a green leaf of a date-palm tree, split it into two pieces and planted one on each grave and said, "It is hoped that their punishment may be abated till those two pieces of the leaf get dried."

This narration doesn’t prove that the punishment was actually happening in those graves. The words are they are tortured. It is like if go and visit Cairo Museum and we see the mummy of one of the Pharaoh and say that Allah has informed that these were tortured in Hell fire. By these statement no one would extract that Hell is some where in Cairo.

Further it is also reported that one day Prophet was sitting among his companions and suddenly they heard a loud voice. Prophet asked do you know where comes this loud voice. Companions said Only Allah and his Messenger peace be upon him knows about it. Prophet said it the stone which is dropped in Hell seventy years ago, and now it reached its bottom. Does this shows that Hell is somewhere near Medinah? Surely not!

The present treatise is only an effort to guide the reader towards the concept of Azab al-Qabr in Quran and authentic ahadith. There is a plethora of weak narrations on this topic. In fact some of these narrations were concocted to inculcate fear of Allah in hearts and abhorrence from World, as claimed by the narrators. Interested reader may see the books written on Duafa (weak narrators), Majroheen and Kazzab (liars).

**When all this started:**
The concept of returning of soul of dead was never been the part of Muslim belief until the appearance of Imam Ahmed bin Hanbal in political sphere. He got public fame due to his stance on Created Quran doctrine of Mu'tazilites. His student Mussadad bin Musarhad wrote a letter to him and ask him about the belief which a Muslims have due to the wide spread speculative theology of Mu'tazilites. Imam Ahmed wrote a letter which is preserved in its content form in many books, including the famous Tabqat al-Hanabla. Imam Ahmed instructed that one must belief on …

وإن الإيمان بموت ونهاية وظلمة القبر والإيمان بملك الموت يقض الأرواح ثم ترد في الأجساد في الفجر

لا يسألون عن الإيمان والتوحيد

طبقات الحنابلة كاملًا (طبقات الحنابلة كاملًا لابي يعلى الحنابل)
(Juz 1, pg 314)

*Munkar & Nakeer (so-called names of two angels who would come for questioning) and torment in grave and believe in angel of death that caught the souls then return them in the bodies in the graves, asking about faith and tawheed*
As a Muslim it is important that we bring our believes in accordance with Holy Quran. May Allah send his blessings on our last Prophet Muhammad peace be upon him and guide us towards his mercy and Heavens and save us from Azab al-Qabr and Hell Fire. Amen